

**Waste Industry Safety and Health (WISH) Forum**  
Minutes of the meeting held on **25 September 2008 at 10.00 hours**  
**HSE Offices, 1 Hagley Road, Birmingham**

<b>Present</b>	Paul Harvey	Health and Safety Executive	<i>Chair</i>
	Toni Gladding	Chartered Institute of Wastes Management	<i>Secretary</i>
	Chris Jones	Environmental Services Association	
	Geoff Smallwood	Chartered Institute of Wastes Management	
	Colin Mew	Health and Safety Executive	
	Bob Mason	Local Government Employers	
	Vincent Borg	TUC	
	Dick Perry	Waste & Resources Action Programme	
	Pam Kaur	HSE/Hygiene	
	Paul Urbonas	BMRA	
	Mark Foxhall	LARAC	
	Mal Williams	CRN UK	
	Steven Sumner	Local Government Employers	

**Not Attending**

Jeremy Jacobs	The Composting Association
David Buxton	Container Handling Equipment Manufacturers
John Galvin	Defra
Paul Thornber	Environmental Services Association
Lawrence Strong	WAMITAB

**Observers**

Mark Roberts	Taylors
Denise McGynn	EU Skills
Tim Proctor	WRG

1. Membership changes

The issue of chairmanship was raised, as WISH is intended to become industry led. The HSE agreed to chair the meeting for the last time (Paul Harvey).

2. Minutes of last meeting and matters arising

Full findings of the Bomel2 report are about to be published and will be discussed later in the meeting.

**Information Items**

3. Presentation: Occupational Hygiene in MRFs

Pam Kaur of the HSE attended the meeting to discuss a new project the HSE are undertaking. PK is an occupational hygiene specialist inspector at Grimstead with responsibilities for waste and recycling. The inspectors have found lots of work going on in composting, but needed more information on MRFs. Hence a small pilot project has been designed purely on health and hygiene. This includes exposure to airborne microorganisms and their toxic products, and as number of employees increase this may become more of an issue. A project brief was distributed amongst WISH members, listing 'dirty' and 'clean' MRFs processing household waste to be involved in the study and looking at people working in these facilities. The survey is to include an air monitoring for inhalable dust, respirable dust, bioaerosols (total counts), glucans and endotoxins via HSL. The study will also gather information on processes, with a health questionnaire. Six premises are to be involved, three south and three in Scotland, including a mix of local authority and private, and the visits are to begin in late November.

The WISH Group commented on the very few 'dirty' MRFs that are now in the UK and there may be difficulties locating them – also that there was more of a gradation between the two. Indicators of the MRF were suggested instead, e.g. amount of residue, capacity and throughput, number of people working there etc. The project will report back to the WISH committee.

**Action:** DP of WRAP agreed to send some information on MRF types to PK

#### 4. Latex gloves health risk

Trevor Hay had a concern from a local authority referred to him about dermatitis from latex gloves. However, this issue was not regarding single use gloves, but long life latex gloves. After further research the risk has been determined to be very low.

#### 5. Publications, research and webpages

HSE report: Several publications are now at the printers/editors and are about to be uploaded. This includes noise and glass, design of MRFs, offensive hygiene waste, and hazardous waste at CA sites.

In terms of further HSE research it is the intent to look at ill health and days lost. The bid is still in and delayed due to staff issues.

Web – Trevor Hay is refurbishing the WISH web pages as a 'last job'. These will now be aligned on a process basis, e.g. collection, treatment etc. to make them easier to navigate. The WISH Committee is asked to comment if any links or placings are out. **Action:** Feedback to PH.

Accidents – fatalities – 2007/8: There are 13 in the industry. This is an improvement. 2008/9 started April 1<sup>st</sup>. However, there are now up to 11-12 fatalities. There is some concern that this seems to be more than previously. Fatal accidents are appearing predominantly in skip hire businesses, and associated end of the market. Inspectors are concentrating on scrap metal and metal processing sites currently (by chance). The recorded accidents are mostly transport related, e.g. man and vehicle, on sites. (Figures include members of the public).

In terms of high profile legal cases – Whites Reclamation is the latest and led to a significant fine. More cases are to be circulated.

HSE do not currently have a 'campaign' to pursue the waste industry, but more incidents appear to be occurring.

#### 6. All Organisations – Strategy and Targets

*BMRA* – there appear to be growing fatalities in the metals industry this financial year. Half a day workshop has been arranged at Hull docks, with 60 companies turning out. The day included demonstration of grab crane, workplace transport etc. The day identified that standards of competency for grab cranes are needed. The day also included items on working at height and scrap machinery, and de-pollution of cars from HSE.

- Of continued concern is the safe identification, storage and disposal of LPG and gas cylinders. The Director of the LPG Association accepts there are serious concerns over established disposal routes. This was further highlighted due to a recent case in court regarding a metals recycling business and a fatality from cutting an acetylene bottle, which also included a charge of perverting the course of justice.

*CIWM* – A health and safety special interest group (SIG) is to be formed as a formal group at CIWM. There is some effort being made to try not to replicate WISH membership. This is being led by Tracy Moffatt. Currently CIWM are determining which projects to pursue and to represent diverse membership of CIWM.

- There is also the possibility of a monthly magazine entry regarding health and safety.

*CRN* – There was a meeting at the CRN conference in June in London, which was well attended. Outcomes included members to conduct survey to get statistics for comparison. Some debate was centered on whether to include re-use as well as recycling, with other sectors e.g. community composting and issues with kitchen wastes. Minutes not yet out so items not yet resolved, but when they are finalised they will be sent. **Action:** CRN to send to PH and TG.

CA – not present. However, Jeremy has sent around an email requesting help to collect their own statistics. Chris Jones has sent the ESA model.

- As a note the CA is now known as Association of Organics Recycling.

Chem – not present. David Buxton has sent a report on collection vehicles from France which was distributed at the meeting. Otherwise he reported progress is slow.

EA – not present.

Defra – not present.

ESA – The Executive Board has recently voted on changes to membership requirements. ESA now have an HSG65 scheme, where SMEs can buddy with larger organizations. This is also published on the ESA website. It was reported that concerns were raised amongst members, but ESA considered this a raising of the bar.

- It was also reported that there was still debate on requirement to report fatalities to ESA in terms of bare bones facts. This is to enable the facts to be distributed to people in the industry rapidly (there was a recent case of a failure on a skid steer machine which was useful to disseminate rapidly). There was some concern regarding the legal aspects of ongoing cases, but the forms collect facts only with a requirement to report within 2 weeks. CJ also questioned whether HSE can give out relevant key factors.

- ESA also reported that the accident reduction charter was to be renewed. In addition, more meaningful and pointed issues were being sought. There is a 'Vision 0' approach (0 fatalities and major injuries) at ESA.

- Safe collection document has been 2 years in gestation. Some companies attempting to set up useful schemes practical and not too onerous.

- The issue of a standard for ballistic trousers was also raised, as there are currently none. There is also much variation between suppliers. ESA reported a need to understand the range and standards needed, to determine appropriate one. It was noted that nylon trousers are not necessarily very puncture resistant. An HSE contact was given by Pam Kaur as Nick Thorne at Buxton who has knowledge of PPE and standards.

LARAC – contributed to safe collection routes and acted as conduit.

- LARAC also working with WRAP on what is a good recycling service. This included providing a template for which 5 pilot schemes on recycling collection should include, e.g. standardization of boxes, materials etc. LARAC saw this as an opportunity to put in compliance with H&S guidance at the beginning of the project.

- New chair and business plan to be developed.

- There is an H&S slot planned for upcoming conference.

- There are policy position statements out for comment currently including health and safety but not as a main theme.

*LGA* – the LGA has been promoting and supporting a risk assessment campaign, well-being at work (Dame Carol Black response) with the public sector as an exemplar. This includes promoting leadership guidance from IoD and HSE, and boardroom responsibility following on from corporate manslaughter act.

- In terms of waste and recycling they are working with HSE on their procurement project.
- Noise document – still working on reducing noise during glass collection. Different linings to troughs etc. may be trialed.
- Working with EU Skills on training and supervision with managers and standards of competence.

*Trade Unions* – The Unions are also involved in the HSE risk assessment initiative and have produced a new guide for safety reps. There has also been a run of produced leaflets to encourage workers to ask about risk assessments.

- Work programme for 2009 in progress, some waste specific issues may be included (currently in consultation).
- Deputy Director of the TUC has written to Defra and HSE for ministerial summit on waste and recycling.

*Wamitab* – not present.

*WRAP* – WRAP have a rolling programme with client authorities and this includes picking up on H&S issues as they occur. However, the importance of H&S is much higher than previously. WRAP recognises that policy and practice is needed to initiate change, particularly regarding collection systems. Letting of contracts is also recognised as a concern in terms of H&S.

- Major piece of work on health effects of fortnightly residual waste collections due for publication October.
- Taking a programme forward working with appropriate organizations, including MRFs and client contractor relationships, and noise in collection activities.

## 7. Bomel2

Paul Harvey gave a quick summary of the soon to be published Bomel2 report. This report utilises the same dataset and approach as Bomel1 with improved employment data, e.g. Incidence rates 2001-2006, with the benchmark at 2001/2 – 2003/4.

- Further work has also been carried out on data from local authorities (50/50 split contracted out/in house).

- Accidents – SIC codes/occupation/vehicle and process descriptors flags were used. 4,000 accidents p.a. are shown, with a slow increase in total numbers.
- Incidence rate increasing for SIC code recycling metal (37.1) (possible coding issue) but over 2000 per 100K employees equals 11% worse. Recycling non metal also increased (SIC 37.2) 9% worse. SIC 51.57 wholesale waste decreased, but are a small sub-set (7000 employees). SIC 90.0 refuse collection and treatment private sector generally decreased and below all industry average improved 8%.
- The all industry average – 2500, reduced since 2003/4 3.5%.
- In terms of accident kind – handling/sprains most numerous. This is followed by trips, then struck by. Predominantly refuse collection and disposal (however, collection is a wide definition and cannot be separated down to material type).
- Accidents by age – Bomel1, to Bomel2 age shifted up by 5 years.
- In conclusion there is a general improvement of 3.5% up to 2005/6.
- Publication of the report and a press release is expected within 2-3 weeks.

#### 8. Streetsafe Sam – Commercial Collection

- Module 2 on recycling was released in June 400 copies.
- Module 3 due within next few weeks on industrial/commercial dry waste collection.
- EU Skills is looking at a sustainable business model and plan for next 5 modules, and updating those already out. This includes talking to stakeholders about further funding. (It was noted that the publications produced are non-profit free copies).
- It is recognised that problems exist with proliferation to SMEs.

**Action:** Denise McGlynn to send a link to the website to all members to promote where they can be obtained.

#### 9. ESA Occupational Health Group

Geoff Smallwood reported the first meeting is to take place on Monday 29th September. Objectives are still to be decided. The group consists of HR and H&S groups joined. In terms of priorities the first is to see what is occurring in the industry, and secondly to look at collecting data/analysis to look at trends. Commonality of data and approach an issue but sharing of information planned. The aim eventually is to define occupational health schemes for member ESA companies.

### **Discussion Items**

#### 10. Safe Collection Routes

Guidance has been distributed as a 'final' edition on 4<sup>th</sup> July '08. There is continuing debate over wording on single/sided double/sided issue and decision making processes. It was reported that wider distribution has led to further debate from local authorities. However, final feedback from this sector is to be provided by end of October by an H&S Officers group.

**Action:** WISH members to accept document in principle. There will be a final copy circulated after the local authority October deadline for final comment by WISH members. All comments must be within a two week deadline from circulation.

#### 11. Offensive hygiene Wastes

CJ expressed concern about the status of the document as an HSE document rather than a WISH document. He also reported concerns from ESA over blood borne viruses and needlestick injuries and further clarification needed.

**Action:** Paul Harvey to pursue clarification.

#### 12. Lock off

HSE consider that there is inconsistent language and terms identified in the draft currently being circulated. The guidance draft is also far too imprecise; hence it is being re-submitted to an engineer for further work. It was discussed that an earlier draft may be more practical.

**Action:** Geoff Smallwood to send original draft.

#### 13. Strategic objectives/Target Setting

- The objectives and targets were discussed in terms of adoption as a five year plan.

Many organisations have commented, specifically DG and ESA comments on targets for competence. It was suggested to adopt it as it stands without specific numbers and a sub-working group to determine those.

- ESA comments (circulated with agenda) were also reviewed. This included issues with data from Bomell 1 and 2, suggestion to add further credible sources of data or to use it as an indicator in the absence of anything more specific. Consensus was reached on this point.

- There was further discussion regarding terms, e.g. mentioning well-being rather than welfare as a more modern interpretation. This was also agreed.

- Objective 1: Reservations about 40% reduction targets over 5 years discussed. Other options such as 10% year on year also considered – points were made that if the target was not achieved the industry will be perceived as having failed. 10% marker agreed.

- Objective 2: Working days lost has no specific targets, benchmarking and markers of health. Change of wording to occupational health and safety incidence or worker-related ill health was discussed. This is to include an emphasis on health side of strategy – and statement on seeking to adopt a health objective within 24 months. This was agreed.
- Objective 3: Management of H&S (HSG65). This was agreed.
- Objective 4: Improving safety culture. This was agreed.
- Objective 5: Competence. Concerns were expressed over the data available. NVQ and in-house training systems were agreed to be taken as a starting point. The further intention to establish a working group to determine metrics within 24 months was discussed. This was agreed.
- A final version of this document is to be circulated to WISH within a month, and it is requested that responses are within one month of circulation, e.g. middle of November. It was agreed there would then be a planned formal launch with senior members of member organizations in 2009.

#### 14. To discuss and agree the proposed WISH constitution

##### **Decision items**

The draft circulated with the agenda was discussed. The following points were made:

- Comments on calling WISH as a multi-party forum with each member organisation to have commitment to H&S within their sphere of influence.
- ESA has added in some aims and objectives which were agreed.
- WISH members – taken as a core membership but ability to call in others as and when useful for working groups and similar agreed.
- Each organisation to be represented, but numbers of representatives are not to be defined.
- Each organisation to have a vote rather than each representative.
- Amendment paragraph re: working groups accepted.
- Agreement on what makes WISH quorate – 50% plus one organisation to be present.
- Original paragraph 13 to be re-adopted for 2/3 majority for constitutional change.
- Edited version to be adopted as a constitution

**Action:** Paul Harvey to re-circulate within one month. Any final objections must be fed back to PH within 2 weeks of the final circulation.

#### 15. To agree the Noise in Glass collection guidance

All previous comments have now been accommodated in the latest version that was circulated with the agenda. A few small edits were proposed at the meeting (multi-material rather than co-mingled, replacing a sentence re: collection).

**Action:** To be amended and published ASAP.

16. Any other business

Chairmanship – The Chairmanship is to be passed over at the next meeting. Any nominations for a new chair are to go to Toni Gladding as Secretary by 25<sup>th</sup> October, if more than two are received the Secretary will organise an electronic vote.

- Thanks were given to Chris Jones for nominating Richard Skyens (CEO of Grundon and outgoing Chair of ESA).

- Handling Asbestos safely – a draft had previously been circulated aimed at skip hiring and waste transfer, but had since not been re-circulated.

**Action:** Status to be reviewed by Paul Harvey.

17. Date of next meetings

**Tuesday 27th January 2009 at ESA London for 10 am**

**Thursday 21<sup>st</sup> May 2009 at Taylors in Kidderminster for 10am.**