

Summary of public consultation findings

Introduction

Between 05 June 2006 and 22 September 2006 we invited people to comment on the Health & Safety Commission's (HSC) proposal to introduce a Route Map for Workplace Transport. We are extremely grateful for those who gave up their time to respond, some very comprehensively. We also extend our warmest thanks to those who attended the meetings to hear more about the Route Map from those closely involved in its development.

To recap from the consultation document:

The purpose of the Route Map is to provide easy to find and follow directions to information describing the basics of what employers need to do to manage their workplace transport operations safely. It will also direct the seeker to suggestions for practical improvements in these areas. The Route Map will provide a framework in which employers and workers can understand the role of the existing workplace transport related regulations and guidance. It will provide the basis for an easy system of reference. It is not our intention to duplicate or replace good useful guidance. Instead, we will be providing clear links from the route map to the existing guidance and only producing new guidance where important gaps are identified.

The reason for this is:

Workplace transport is still the second biggest cause of fatal injury in the workplace. Since 1998/99 there has been an average of 66 fatalities, over 2100 major injuries and over 4200 injuries requiring the injured person to be off work for more than 3 days each year. This has cost, and will continue to cost, the Exchequer hundreds of millions of pounds.

Summary information:

You can revisit the consultation document via the following link. Please note that as the consultation closed last September the system will not accept any new information:

<http://consultations.hse.gov.uk/inovem/consult.ti/wptms>

- 14,040 'hits' were recorded on the workplace transport consultation document webpages
- 1,845 people registered a firm interest on those pages
- 531 considered themselves participants (i.e. they signed up to take part)
- 116 responses were submitted, of these:
 - 86 were electronic questionnaires
 - 6 were e-mails
 - 8 were letters
 - 9 were hard copy questionnaires
 - 1 was a memo, and
 - 4 were submissions)

PLEASE NOTE. The figures below are indicative as they are derived from the questionnaire responses only. This does not mean we failed to include or appreciate the information submitted in a non standard format but unfortunately, we did not have the resource to arrive at a 'tabular' match. The majority of those submitting non standard responses have waived their confidentiality and their input is available upon request (please see below).

Initial findings

83% of those who responded were in favour of the approach we suggested with 16 of the 30 questions receiving positive responses of 70% and above (the highest being 96%). A small proportion of the remainder thought we were not going far enough with an equally small proportion believing our proposals to be excessive. The majority of the comments received were considered to be directional, i.e. what people would like to see included in the Route Map.

The medical issues generated most concern with 56% of respondents saying that we need to provide more information on dealing with them. We intend to address this in the coming months in co-operation with the Corporate Medical Group. Similarly, the sharing of information between organisations is something else that respondents said that they wanted help with. Only 44% believed it would be easy.

We are also concerned that only 40% of respondents believed that workers understand their responsibilities. This is something we intend to raise with colleagues in HSE's Worker Involvement Programme. Finally the name "Route Map" received less than favourable 'press' with only 59% believing that it explains clearly what is meant. We will be seeking the help of communications experts to take this forwards.

Participants

We asked those participating if they would like their responses to remain confidential or if they would mind having them published. 59 waived their confidentiality. It is possible that this list could increase as we finalise our work on the responses that were submitted in different formats (to the questionnaire).

Name	Organisation	Business Sector
Ahmed E. Fakhroo	Bahrain Petroleum Company	Manufacturing
Allan Holt	Royal Mail Group	Other Service Activities
Andy Brazier	No Details Given	No Details Given
Andy Grant	Consort Homes Ltd	Construction
Andy Platt	The Pallet Network Ltd	Transport, Storage &
Communication		
Bill Delamare	Visteon UK Ltd	Manufacturing
Brenig Morgan	Smurfit Kappa Yate	Manufacturing
Brian Hughes	Peninsula Business Services	Other
Chris Harris	Smiths (Gloucester) Ltd	Construction
Chris Hughes	Morgan Est	Construction
Coal Merchants Federation	Coal Merchants Federation (GB) Limited	Wholesale & Retail Trade
Colin Snape	Langdon Industries Ltd	Transport, Storage &
Communication		
Daniel Chilton	DIAGEO	Wholesale and Retail
Trade		
Dave Joyce	Communication Workers' Union	Other
Dave Skipsey	Cheltenham Borough Homes Ltd	Other Service Activities
David Brewer	Buildings Research Establishment Ltd	Research & Development
Derek Maylor	Communication Workers Union	Other Service Activities
Derek Smith	Sheffield City Council	Public Administration &
Defence		
Donella Durber	Delice de France	Transport, Storage &
Communication		
Emily Ramsay	The Forestry Commission	Public Administration &
defence		
Gareth Pritchard	Highway Electrical Academy - ASLEC	Construction
Geoff Smallwood	Shanks Waste Management Ltd	Other
Hugh Robertson	Trades Union Congress	Other
Jackie Dickens	Northamptonshire County Council	Other
James McPartland	TDG	No Business Details
Registered		
Janet Asherson	Confederation of British Industry	other
Jayn Johnson	Health & Safety Executive	Other
Jeff Lewis	The Bristol Port Company	Other Service Activities
Jim Adshead	London Fire Brigade	Other Service Activities
Joanna Hancock	British Frozen Foods Federation	Other Business Activities
John McClean	GMB Trade Union	Other
John Thompson	Sedgefield Borough Council	Other
John Westmoreland	Individual capacity	Not Applicable

Julie Gelder	Cyril Sweett	Construction
Karen Saville	Pennine Care NHS Trust	Health & Social Work
Karen Heatley	Scottish Fisheries Protection Agency	Other Business Activities
Karen Wilson	GSL UK Limited	Other Service Activities
Kashmir Singh LL.B, MM.B	British Sikh Federation	Other
Keith Molyneux	Knauf Insulation	Manufacturing
Kevin Heath	Colchester Borough Council	Other Service Activities
Lawrence Parker	Sir Robert McAlpine	Construction
Lee Smyth	Aylesford Newsprint Ltd	Manufacturing
Leon	Halcrow International	Construction
Malcolm Copson	GeoPost UK Ltd	Storage &
Communication		
Malcolm Wood	GR Advanced Materials Ltd	Manufacturing
Mario Lombardo	Ibstock Brick Limited	Manufacturing
Mark Cox	Brakes Food Service	Other Business Activities
Michael Colborne	Amber Services	Other
Morris Dickie	Voss Training International Limited	Other Service Activities
Nigel Osborne	East Malling Research	Research & Development
Peter Boulton	Communication Workers Union	Transport, Storage &
Communication		
Peter Bull	Ciba Speciality Chemicals	Other
Richard Ash	Engineering Construction Industry Association	Manufacturing
Richard Hulmes	SAFED	Other Service Activities
Robert Suttle	British Airways	Transport, Storage &
Communication		
Roger Bibbings	Royal Society for the Prevention of Accidents	Other Service Activities
Roger de Toney	The CPI Corrugated Sector	Manufacturing
Simon Hutchings	Individual capacity	Not Applicable
Simon Judd	Brett	Mining & Quarrying
Stephen Eaton	S Eaton Fuels	No Business Details
Registered		
Steve Johnson	Drive & Survive UK Limited	Other Service Activities
Thomas (Tom) Bennett	Menzies Distribution	Other
Tony Bough	Wear Valley District Council	Public Administration &
Defence		
Tony Hull	London Borough of Enfield	Other
Tony Woodley	Transport & General Workers' Union	Other
V Miles	East Lancashire Chamber of Commerce	No Business Details
Registered		
Valerie Cameron	Royal Environment Health Institute of Scotland	No Business Details
Registered		
Vincent Borg	UNISON	Other
Wayne Smith	British Coatings Federation	Manufacturing

Results in brief

Here are the results in brief. A breakdown for each question can be found below:

Q1 Is it clear from the proposal what you have to do to meet the requirements of the route map?

Option	Results
Clear	81%
Neither clear nor unclear	10%
Unclear	8%
Don't know	1%

88 people answered

47 people commented

Q2 What would be the impact to your business of arranging the site so that vehicle movements are eliminated or kept to a minimum?

Option	Results
Positive	61%
Negative	26%
Don't know	13%

84 people answered
47 people commented

Q3 Does the route map give enough detail to enable you to construct and set out the site in such a way to make it safe for the people and vehicles using it?

Option	Results
Yes	63%
No	28%
Don't know	3%

88 people answered
45 people commented

Q4 Is it clear from the proposal what you have to do to meet the requirements of the route map?

Option	Results
Clear	76%
Neither clear nor unclear	10%
Unclear	10%
Don't know	4%

88 people answered
28 people commented

Q5 Is it easy to tell that the vehicles you use are the most suitable ones available for the required job?

Option	Results
Yes	70%
No	23%
Don't know	7%

86 people answered
33 people commented

Q6 Is there a role for drivers to check that their vehicle is safe and report any problems to employers/dutyholders?

Option	Results
Yes	96%
No	3%
Don't know	1%

87 people answered
37 people commented

Q7 Is it clear from the proposal what you have to do to meet the requirements of the route map?

Option	Results
Clear	71%
Neither clear nor unclear	18%
Unclear	10%
Don't know	1%

87 people answered
26 people commented

Q8 Is the meaning of competence (*making sure that workers have the skills and knowledge to do their jobs safely*) clear from the route map?

Option	Results
Clear	77%
Neither clear nor unclear	13%
Unclear	9%
Don't know	1%

87 people answered
28 people commented

Q9 To what extent should competence cover consideration of a person's training and qualifications?

Option	Results
Significantly	74%
Moderately	22%
Slightly	2%

Not at all 1%
Don't know 1%

87 people answered
32 people commented

Q10 Is regular assessment important?

Option	Results
Yes	92%
No	5%
Don't know	3%

88 people answered
64 people commented

Q11 Is refresher training important?

Option	Results
Yes	94%
No	6%
Don't know	0%

85 people answered
66 people commented

Q12 Should we say more in the route map about a person's physical capability to drive?

Option	Results
Yes	60%
No	36%
Don't know	4%

89 people answered
47 people commented

Q13 Is it clear from the proposal what you have to do to meet the requirements of the route map?

Option	Results
Clear	70%

Neither clear nor unclear .19%
Unclear 8%
Don't know 3%

89 people answered
20 people commented

Q14 Have we achieved a reasonable balance on health and medical issues?

Option	Results
Good balance	58%
Neither a good balance nor a poor balance	25%
Poor balance	8%
Don't know	9%

88 people answered
89 people commented

Q15 Do we need to provide more detail on health and medical issues?

Option	Results
Yes	56%
No	31%
Don't know	14%

88 people answered
28 people commented

Q16 Do you think that the assessment should be medical (i.e. carried out by a doctor or other health professional)?

Option	Results
Yes	66%
No	20%
Don't know	14%

88 people answered
35 people commented

Q17 We talk in the route map about the need for 'periodic fitness assessments'. By this, we mean a sliding scale based on need and the nature of the work involved. For example, at the upper end this may be a full medical carried out by a doctor or other health professional

and at the lower end it may be a self-assessment questionnaire. Do you think this is the correct approach?

Option	Results
Yes	77%
No	16%
Don't know	9%

88 people answered
36 people commented

Q18 Is it clear from the proposal what you have to do to meet the requirements of the route map?

Option	Results
Clear	60%
Neither clear nor unclear	17%
Unclear	17%
Don't know	6%

88 people answered
27 people commented

Q19 Are instructions required for visiting drivers/pedestrians to a site?

Option	Results
Yes	92%
No	6%
Don't know	2%

88 people answered
40 people commented

Q20 Is it clear from the proposal what you have to do to meet the requirements of the route map?

Option	Results
Clear	77%
Neither clear nor unclear	13%
Unclear	9%
Don't know	1%

88 people answered
19 people commented

Q21 Should we say more about the management of workers?

Option	Results
Yes	44%
No	46%
Don't know	10%

87 people answered
27 people commented

Q22 Do workers understand their responsibilities?

Option	Results
Yes	40%
No	34%
Don't know	26%

88 people answered
40 people commented

Q23 Is it clear from the proposal what you have to do to meet the requirements of the route map?

Option	Results
Clear	70%
Neither clear nor unclear	17%
Unclear	8%
Don't know	5%

87 people answered
18 people commented

Q24 How easy would it be to share information about how to work safely?

Option	Results
Easy	44%
Neutral	37%

Difficult .14%
Don't know 5%

87 people answered
33 people commented

Q25 Are systems in place to resolve a disagreement about health and safety?

Option	Results
Yes	74%
No	12%
Don't know	14%

88 people answered
25 people commented

Q26 We have referred to these proposals as a route map. Do you think the name explains clearly what is meant?

Option	Results
Yes	59%
No	29%
Don't know	12%

89 people answered
32 people commented

Q27 Do you support the approach we have suggested

Option	Results
Yes	83%
No	9%
Don't know	8%

88 people answered
33 people commented

Q28 We would appreciate any comments that you wish to make on the comparative costs and benefits of the proposals

33 people commented

Q29 Are there any categories of driver or organisation that should be exempt from these proposals?

Option	Results
Yes	5%
No	79%
Don't know	16%

89 people answered
21 people commented

Q30 Are there any areas where you think specific guidance or advice may be needed?

Option	Results
Yes	59%
No	21%
Don't know	20%

86 people answered
47 people commented

Results in detail

These can be obtained from the Workplace Transport Team upon request (please see contact details below).

Further information

Further information about Workplace Transport can be found on our website at the following address:

<http://www.hse.gov.uk/workplacetransport/index.htm>

Contact

If you wish to discuss the emerging Route Map please contact HSE's Workplace Transport Team at:

Workplace Transport Team
Health & Safety Executive
8NW Rose Court
2 Southwark Bridge
LONDON
SE1 9HS

Alternatively ring them on:

Telephone: **020 7717** 6840 / 6303 / 6127 / 6366 / 6066 / 6059

Or e-mail them via:

workplacetransport@hse.gsi.gov.uk