

**AGRICULTURAL INDUSTRY ADVISORY COMMITTEE  
WORKPLACE TRANSPORT PROJECT GROUP**

**WORKSHOP**

**Summary of workshop held on 12 August 2005 at HSE, Stoneleigh Park.**

**Present:**

Alan Plom (Chair)*	HSE Agriculture & Food Sector
Roger Nourish	“
Tony Mitchell	“
Bruno Porter	“
David Leavesley*	NFU Mutual
Craig Lawrence	“
Marcus Themans*	NFU
Timothy Drew*	Lantra
Jake Vowles*	Agricultural Engineers Association
Alan Mendelson	Dept for Transport
Nigel Davey	IOSH/consultant
Ian Jones	British Agricultural and Garden Machinery Association

*Nb. \* indicates AIAC nominated member of AIAC Transport Project Group*

## **1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS**

1.1 Alan Plom (Head of Safety Section, HSE’s Agriculture & Food Sector) welcomed delegates and explained the Workshop had been arranged on behalf of the HSC’s recently re-constituted Agricultural Industry Advisory Committee (AIAC), which has set up a Workplace Transport Project Group to ‘shadow’ this area of HSE’s priority work. The Workshop was intended to facilitate discussion and an exchange of information between all interested ‘stakeholders’. A wider range of organisations than are represented on the AIAC were therefore invited.

1.2 It was anticipated that the main outcome of the workshop was for all delegates to identify ways in which their organisations can (and will) contribute to reducing injuries and ill health in agriculture. This was not just about helping HSE to deliver effective interventions through its projects, outlined in the draft Project Workplan, circulated in advance of the Workshop. A summary of statistics had also been sent to all invitees as background information and to put this topic into context.

1.3 Delegates outlined their background, experience and particular individual and organisations’ interest in this topic. These are summarised in section 5 below. Unfortunately, two of the AIAC member organisations (TGWU and National Association of Agricultural Contractors) were not represented at the meeting, but will receive these notes and any information subsequently provided.

## **2. HSE’S NEW STRUCTURE, STRATEGY AND PROGRAMMES**

2.1 Roger Nourish (Head of HSE’s Agriculture & Food Sector) presented a paper “Strategy for Delivery of the PSA Targets: Agriculture” which outlined the revised structure and arrangements

in HSE to help deliver its 3 new Public Service Agreement (PSA) targets, ie to reduce fatal and major injuries (by 3%), work-related ill health (6%) and days lost due to work-related injuries and ill health (9%) by 2007/08. This paper describes how HSE's activities are now project-based and how its work in agriculture and related industries contribute to HSC's Strategy and to HSE's "Fit for work, fit for life, fit for tomorrow" (Fit3) Strategic Programme and its associated projects.

2.2 It was anticipated that the AIAC's Project Group "Reducing Transport Related Accidents" would make a significant contribution to help the industry achieve these targets and HSE is now seeking comments on the draft Workplan for the AIAC's Project Group. The aims, objectives and workstreams (projects) outlined in the draft workplan circulated before the meeting were based on HSE's current agricultural transport project, scheduled to run for the 3 years, 2005-08. These objectives need to be reviewed and broadened to encompass the potential contributions of the wide range of stakeholders represented on the AIAC and at the meeting.

2.3 It was agreed that improving 'communications' and sharing information was vital. More needs to be made of available statistics and summaries/analyses of accidents. Delegates considered that HSE should consider road-transport issues too.

### 3. **THE CURRENT PICTURE**

3.1 Tony Mitchell (HSE) reviewed the baseline evidence: accident history, including the latest fatal accident statistics (launched on 28 July) and other available information. A total of 360 transport-related accidents in agriculture had been reported between 2001-04. These caused 41 deaths, 168 major injuries and 151 3-day injuries. A further 16 deaths were caused by being struck by vehicles in 2004/05. Typically, about 37% of all fatalities in agriculture are related to transport activities, with a significant peak during the harvest period.

3.2 These figures indicate the significant under-reporting prevalent in agriculture. The number and trends in fatalities indicate that transport-related accidents are a major cause of injury and days lost in agriculture and when compared with the typical 'accident triangle' and known level of under-reporting, the figures could probably be increased x5 for major injuries and x20 for over 3-day injuries.

3.3 All delegates were keen for further analysis into types of equipment involved, location and other causative factors. Also to share information, including cost of accidents, particularly from insurers – see item 6 below. An analysis of the 2004/05 injuries will be carried out when these stats are released later in the year. Meanwhile, Tony's ppt presentation summarising the current position and principle causes was sent to delegates after the meeting.

***ACTION – HSE & ALL MEMBERS:*** HSE to circulate the analysis of the 2004/05 data asap, for stakeholders to use and publicise.

### 4. **REVIEW OF HSE's CURRENT PROJECTS**

4.1 **Agriculture Transport Project** - Tony Mitchell (Project Manager) described how this project contributes to the 3 simple themes of HSE's overarching Workplace Transport Programme: "Safe Site, Safe Vehicle, Safe Driver". The project's 3 workstreams were illustrated using 'route maps' indicating the role and potential contribution of key partners in their delivery, eg influencing farmers through the supply chain and dealer network and BAGMA's Vehicle Health Check Scheme as a means to promote improved maintenance of vehicles. This together with driver

competence and training are key aspects for enforcement by HSE.

4.2 Limited available resources for inspection and the seasonality of production and use of transport equipment are major factors and therefore HSE's enforcement workstream and the timing of the proposed 12 one-day joint HSE/Vehicle and Operator Services Agency (VOSA) roadside-check initiatives take account of these by focussing effort during key periods in the most appropriate parts of the country. This project, themed "Safe on-road, Safe off-road", was widely publicised in trade journals and local press and media following the issue of a press release in July.

***ACTION – ALL DELEGATES:** To raise awareness of these initiatives and to comment on the draft 'intervention logic'-based 'route maps', sent to delegates by e-mail after the meeting.*

***ACTION – HSE/ALL:** Publicity material and information on the HSE/VOSA inspection initiatives and HSE enforcement activities to be circulated asap, for stakeholders to use and publicise.*

4.3 **Food Chain Project** – This project, being run by Bruno Porter, was intended to identify and engage businesses in the food processing and supply chain capable of influencing farmers, ie through industry organisations as well as individual companies, cooperatives, wholesalers and other Agencies. Examples of schemes, incentives and possible future activities to promote health and safety were being sought. Information on the costs and benefits of maintenance in avoiding breakdowns and consequent delays in production, processing and delivery were also needed to help promote the business case for h&s.

***ACTION – ALL DELEGATES:** To send any information relevant to the Food Chain project to Bruno Porter.*

4.4 **Safety (and Health) Awareness Days** (SADs) are part of the Sector's 'Self-employed and family farms' project, managed by Alan Plom. This 3-year project is now the main route by which HSE is reaching small farms, with ~24 events being organised throughout the country each year. Each SAD consists of up to 7 practical demonstrations, mostly presented by Lantra-registered instructors. The scenarios invariably include at least one transport-related activity, eg tractor maintenance, use of materials handlers and/or ATVs. These are repeated in 2 half-day sessions, typically attended by between 200 and 300 farmers/day. This is a cost-effective intervention method but the impact on achieving actual improvements on the farm is being further evaluated by the Bomel research team in the near future, as part of their development of a tool to evaluate 'Cultural Change'.

4.4 **Research** – A number of transport-related projects were identified by Alan Plom and discussed, including:

- **Whole-body vibration** (WBV) - HSE intended to complete recent work measuring operator exposure from a range of machines. This would contribute to the development of 'best practice' guidance for the industry, and to establish a standard methodology for assessing WBV emissions. This was needed by manufacturers/importers and regulators.
- **Tractor/trailer braking systems** - Work is urgently needed on design and performance of braking systems for tractors, trailers and other trailed appliances,
- **Cab air-filtration** - Development of systems and test methods for tractors and self-propelled pesticide sprayers, etc.
- **Materials handling** - A review of 'reduced-height' alternative loaders to replace the skid-steer loaders (with non-complying 'cut-down' ROPS), currently used for

cleaning out low poultry sheds.

4.6 The Sector had proposed commissioning a suite of 6 projects on these topics with Silsoe Research Institute (SRI), but these had been held in abeyance until its future was clear. SRI, the sole remaining specialist agricultural engineering research institute in the country, is being closed down as the BBSRC are ceasing to fund it. Unfortunately, the representations made by HSE, DfTr, AEA and manufacturers were unsuccessful in persuading BBSRC to retain a test and research facility at Silsoe. The current head of the facility is endeavouring to establish a company to continue to provide this service to industry and regulators, and the Sector still intends to commission this work with him. (nb. The ppt presentation listing the proposed projects was sent by e-mail to delegates after the Workshop.)

4.7 Delegates were supportive and agreed that the proposed work on braking systems and WBV is vital to help inform and support the development of European legislation, standards and assist enforcement, in relation to on-road as well as off-road working. Consequently, these projects have been developed as partnership working, with financial support from DfTr and support 'in kind' from manufacturers, where relevant. Braking projects were more relevant to DfTr's remit as this was mostly a road safety-related issue, whereas WBV was more for HSE.

***ACTION – HSE and DfTr to discuss and agree proportionate joint funding of projects, as appropriate.***

4.8 **Road accident research** sponsored by DfTr in recent years has included a 3 year study by Richard Gard reviewing road accidents involving agricultural vehicles investigated by the Police and reported in the media. In addition to the common theme of lack of maintenance of brakes and coupling systems, this work had clearly established that a prime cause was defective lighting, trafficators and warning signs, leading to collisions with farm vehicles, particularly whilst turning right from highways during transport operations. Approx 30 members of the public and 10 farmers/employees were killed in road accidents each year.

4.9 The AEA and HSE felt that this work could have been more focussed and would have benefitted from more detailed analysis. DfTr has agreed to sponsor this project for a further year, to carry out a causative analysis and to identify what lessons could be learned and remedial action taken, including possible new legislation. In this context, international standardisation can often be a major impediment to achieving improvements in vehicle design.

4.10 NFU Mutual reported that major injuries caused by road accidents were the most expensive to insurers, being about 15% of their company's total claims and totalling about £53mill paid out in 2003. About half of the 'large loss' accounts (ie claims in excess of £0.5mill) are due to right-turn accidents. Their statistics indicated that 46% of drivers involved in collisions were under 30 years old, suggesting a relationship with training and competence. Other common factors included mud and inconspicuity, eg defective lighting and limited visibility from farm/field exits on to roads. Driver awareness and visibility – maintenance of mirrors, trafficators, etc was vital.

***ACTION – HSE:** It was agreed that the key points and causative factors highlighted could usefully be incorporated in the guidance proposed by HSE to help minimise operator exposure to WBV by managing transport operations to avoid hazards and routes causing excessive vibration and shock.*

4.11 **Evaluation** – Alan Plom emphasised that evaluation was paramount and an integral part of all HSE's initiatives and research. The Sector had commissioned Bomel to develop a tool to

measure behavioural and cultural change from interventions and this would be used to evaluate the Sector's projects and HSE's interventions in agriculture.

## **5. OTHER ORGANISATION'S ACTIVITIES**

5.1 Each delegate described their respective initiatives, guidance, networks and potential to influence, leading to helpful discussion and identifying future liaison opportunities between stakeholders as well as with HSE. Delegates reported the following:

5.1.1 **BAGMA** – Ian Jones gave a presentation on their **Vehicle Health Check Scheme** (VHCS) developed in consultation with HSE Ag Sector. A copy of the basic check list was issued to delegates. NFU Mutual have 3k copies of the BAGMA VHCS booklet and issue this to farmers via their Marketing Dept/Agency network. Ian outlined the training given and available to dealer's engineers, developed in association with Lantra. BAGMA have established common inspection procedures for the members inspecting lift trucks and argue that further clarification and a tougher line is needed on the application of LOLER to lifting equipment on farms, to require them to be examined and tested. BAGMA have also been developing a common 'installation scheme' to provide training on use of new machines in collaboration with manufacturers, based on operators manuals.

5.1.2 BAGMA's VHCS is being used as a basis for HSE's Agricultural Transport Project, in particular the supply chain workstream involving BAGMA dealers and HSE's peak activity inspection and enforcement campaign. However, due to the relatively low level of inspection activity by HSE, there was very little baseline data on the current condition of farm vehicles. ***ACTION** – BAGMA to develop research proposal to provide this base-line data.*

5.1.3 The AEA, manufacturers and DfTr fully support the VHCS approach. AEA held the view that inspections under VHCS should be carried out by competent qualified (dealer) engineers, similar to the National Sprayer Test Scheme. AEA also endorsed BAGMA's Installation Training initiative.

5.1.4 **AEA** – Represented manufacturers and importers, coordinating input and response to European legislation and standards, lobbying UK Government and Departments, etc. Recent initiatives included the AEA's OPEC working with HSE to revise the guidance on use of **ATV's** and an ongoing campaign to publicise the requirements and guidance, eg by challenging advertising of a wide range of products using illustrations of unsafe practices and inadequate driver ppe and writing to all agricultural show and event Secretaries emphasising the need to demonstrate good practice (nb AEA's letter was endorsed by HSE's Alan Plom). AEA's ATV manufacturer members are promoting driver training through the USA-originated EASI Scheme

5.1.5 Jake Vowles also reported on recent research on ROPS on ATVs (sponsored by the Australian State Govt) and design of helmets for ATV drivers. He also referred to the confusion and debate over application of licensing to "quadricycles" on the road, and implications for vehicles imported via the SVA Scheme. Many are being imported directly with no training offered, even being sold on 'e-Bay'. ***ACTION** - DfTr to clarify.*

5.1.6 **NFU Mutual** – The largest insurers in the sector, their Risk Management Surveyors have contact with and visit a high proportion of farms. Transport accidents represent a major part of insurers 'large-loss accounts' and Craig Lawrence had carried out research into this area. They are planning a joint initiative with NFU to promote ATV helmets and considering a Safety

Awareness Day for ATV operators, possibly in conjunction with a supplier.

5.1.7 **NFU** – As above, working with the NFU Mutual on their ATV initiative.

5.1.7 **Lantra** – The implications of the re-organisation of Lantra into the Sector Skills Council for the land-based industries, taking a strategic view and providing funding and support for training and the creation of Lantra Awards as a separate training/certification/ registration arm were explained.

5.1.8 **Nigel Davey** (independent safety consultant/advisor) had heard about the AIAC's activities and the Transport Project Group through the IoSH Rural Industries Group. He emphasised the contribution of professional H&S practitioners in promoting and applying good practice and current guidance, through working directly with businesses to improve their standards and profitability. They have extensive communications networks which can be exploited to convey information and encourage their clients.members to contribute, as well as to collect, share and feedback ideas and innovations.

5.1.9 An example of this network was the Food Industry Safety and Health Network (FISHNet) based in East Anglia. This group is actively supported by HSE and is chaired by Nigel. They are interested in promoting practical improvements and organise training and events for members, eg a recent event on site transport and pedestrian segregation held at a British Sugar plant was attended by 180 people.

***ACTION** – Alan Plom to send Nigel's details to Brian Coggans (HSE's Food Section), who is endeavouring to contact local Food Industry Liaison Groups, such as FISHNet.*

## **6. 'BRAINSTORM' SESSION**

6.1 This session was an opportunity to share ideas and identify what we can deliver collectively and individually within our respective organisations, and identify other potential contributors. These notes also reflect issues raised earlier in the Workshop and are amalgamated under the themes of communications and evaluation.

### **Communications**

#### **Information/Accident data**

- Delegates all agreed that more information should be exchanged between stakeholders as this is vital to identify and promote the key messages through guidance and publicity.
- The difference between incentives and penalties was discussed – offering discounts for training and certificates of competence would provide an incentive.
- Lantra are working with Insurers on this, but the AEA had requested data from NFU Mutual and had received no response. David and Craig assured the meeting that the insurance industry were keen on this and would follow it up.

***ACTIONS** – NFU Mutual to consider ways to share analyses and useful information on accidents, in particular costs, with other stakeholders, and to respond to AEA.*

***HSE** will also pursue this with insurers. A conference is planned with major insurers and financial institutions.*

### Safe Vehicles

- **Maintenance** - The most basic requirements of ensuring brakes actually work effectively needs to be promoted.
- **Advice to operators** - NFU suggested developing a decal, as an aide memoire and reminder for operators to perform daily checks. Siting of stickers is important to attract attention whilst avoiding restricting visibility – alongside or on the door in the footwell so it is at eye level as the driver enters the cab would be more effective. Other suggestions included incorporating this info in the tax disc holder and key fobs.  
*ACTIONS – AEA (and others) to inform/advise members. Sponsorship for key fob to be explored.*
- **Pre-start checks** - Nigel Davy suggested that a series of built-in pre-start checks should be introduced, similar to those on HGV's.
- **Lighting** - The intensity and position of lights on many tractors also leaves much to be desired. Again the problem of Type Approval to international standards and the fact that most tractors are now manufactured outside UK prevented such ideas being introduced.
- **Tractor MoT's** - BAGMA and others would like to see a compulsory 'MoT' introduced, but there are practical and legal difficulties and currently there is no (political) pressure to impose new legislation on this.
- **Braking systems** - It is widely recognised that current specifications for braking systems on agricultural tractors in international standards are grossly inadequate for the weights being carried (on the road). Research is needed to review and inform the requirements in new draft European legislation and standards.
- **Brake testing** - Measurement of performance of vehicle braking efficiency was critical, and a simple, easily repeatable, common test protocol was needed, including for tractor/trailer combinations.  
*ACTION – HSE to progress the proposal for braking research at 'Silsoe' urgently, in consultation/jointly with DfTr.*
- **Inspection/enforcement activity** – Delegates called for a higher enforcement profile to reinforce guidance and standards, especially targeting the non-compliant. It was also felt that more should be done to promote designers/manufacturers/importers duties under s6 HSWA and European Directives/SMSR.
- **Regulatory Guidance** – The expansion of Type Approval to a wider range of vehicles, including self-propelled and trailed appliances would be significant and needs publicity. There was further debate over published advice and interpretation of the Construction and Use Regs and application of licensing requirements to farm vehicles, eg the NFU's Transport Guide compared with the AEA's 'flowchart'.  
*ACTIONS – DfTr to clarify and arrange a meeting of interested parties to discuss. [Subsequently held at Silsoe, 15.9.05]*

### Safe Driver

- **Warning others** - It was also suggested that the use of brighter 'safety' colours to alert bystanders and other road users to approaching tractors, projections etc. However, this possibility is prevented by corporate colours schemes for marketing and brand identification.
- **Road Safety/driver training issues** – Many (non-farming) companies place greater emphasis on driver training schemes, eg RoSPA's. This is becoming more important with the increase in tractor speeds and train weights. Some 'chipped' tractors are capable of 60mph! [AEA/manufacturers emphasise this invalidates warranties and

compliance with PUWER ]

- **Public awareness** - Should be raised, to anticipate slow moving farm vehicles and potential movements. It is often difficult to distinguish between HGVs and tractor-drawn trailers. ***ACTION – ALL:** Opportunities for articles such as the NFU's for Motorcycle Union and others.*

### Safe sites

- **Site Management** – The interaction between transport issues and the Falls from Height and Slips and Trips Programmes were discussed, eg delivery vehicles/drivers using unsuitable or unsafe access equipment available on site. This needs to be highlighted and publicised in guidance.
- **Turning** - Nigel Davy reported that some companies were providing turning points and slip lanes at approaches to known right turn blackspots. Drivers should be encouraged to use verges etc as 'havens' and to display warning signs.

### Evaluation : methods and measures

- **Baseline data** – It was agreed that information on the condition of farm vehicles in use was needed, to enable evaluation and targeting of interventions. With the reduction in on-farm inspections by HSE reducing the information being collected, BAGMA proposed a research project involving their dealers to collect baseline data.  
***ACTION – BAGMA + HSE/DfTr:** BAGMA to prepare outline of project to collect baseline data from farms, for consideration by HSE (and DfTr).*

## 7. FUTURE OF THE PROJECT GROUP

7.1 **Review of Workshop** - Delegates all agreed that the Workshop was an extremely valuable and informative event, would enable and encourage interested stakeholders to work together and exchange information. However, more information and data was needed to help focus on the key issues and aspects which would have most impact. There was also a call for more 'joined-up' thinking and action between Government Departments.

7.2 The consensus was that another workshop should be held in 'about a year' to review the position, particularly in the light of progress and evaluation of HSE's projects. Meanwhile information should be exchanged electronically, using the delegates and other stakeholders identified as an informal network of contacts.

7.3 **AIAC Project workplan** - The terms of reference, objectives and membership circulated in the draft AIAC Project workplan were discussed. It was agreed these should be expanded to incorporate an objective for all stakeholders to contribute through working together and sharing information, and also to identify potential 'deliverables' which had emerged from the Workshop.

***ACTION – HSE/ALL:** To revise the objectives in the AIAC Project Group Workplan – To be circulated with notes of the Workshop, for agreement of Group members before submission to the next AIAC meeting in November.*

7.4 **AIAC Project Group Membership** - Alan Plom thanked all delegates for their support and input to the Workshop. He proposed that the formal Project Group membership should consist of representatives of the organisations represented on the AIAC, but would like to keep in contact with all other delegates present, as well as any other interested stakeholders (individuals and

organisations), to share ideas, information and experience.

**Chair's Footnote:** Since the Workshop, the TGWU have nominated Ian Beeby as their representative on the AIAC Project Group. His name has been added, together with Mike Simpson (NAAC) to the list of AIAC members in the attached revised AIAC Project Group Workplan.

***ACTION – ALL DELEGATES & OTHER STAKEHOLDERS:*** *To identify ways in which their organisations can (and will) contribute, and to inform Alan Plom, asap.*

**ALAN PLOM**

Head of Safety Section

Agriculture and Food Sector

HSE, Stoneleigh Park, Kenilworth, Warks CV8 2LG

Tel: 024 7669 8356, Fax: 024 7669 6542

e-mail: alan.plom@hse.gsi.gov.uk