

**MINUTES OF THE SEVENTEENTH MEETING OF THE MOTOR VEHICLE
REPAIR HEALTH & SAFETY FORUM**

WEDNESDAY 7TH MAY 2008

HSE, BIRMINGHAM OFFICE

Present:

Alan McArthur	3M
Andy Hanford	Zurich Risk Services
Andy Lucas	Birmingham City Council
Aslam Vaid	MVRA
Colin Copelin	Confederation of Passenger Transport
Dave Garratt	Garage Equipment Association Ltd
David Innes	Independent Division Scottish Motor Trade Association
David Littleford	Signum Publications Ltd
Debbie Hutchings	Unite/Amicus
Ian Holmes	Sigerson
John Morecroft	VBRA
John Falder	HMG Paints
Malcolm Tagg	VBRA
Paul Cooper	Hartwell PLC (representing Motor Dealer Safety Group)
Paul Whitehead	Freight Transport Association
Peter Barlow	RMIF
Steve Green	Association of Colleges
Terry Crampton	IVR
Andrew Lake	HSE, East Grinstead
Anne Rayner	HSE, Leeds (Minute Secretary)
Geoff Frackelton	HSE, Bootle
Mark Piney	HSE, Birmingham
Peter Woolgar	HSE, Birmingham (Chairman)

1) Welcome, Introduction and Apologies.

Peter Woolgar opened the meeting and welcomed members and speakers to the meeting.

2) Minutes of the last meeting and matters arising

The minutes of the previous meeting on 2007 were agreed as a true record.

Actions arising from previous minutes:

- **Isocyanate Paints Update (item 3)** - Electronic copies of presentations made by Andrew Lake and Peter Griffin to be sent to members
 - *Done.*
- **Dermatitis (item 5)** - Anne Rayner to send copies of the free Dermatitis CD to members
 - *Done.*
- **Bio fuels and Biocides (item 7)** Peter Woolgar and Ian Gardner to reconsider the PPE issue and report back to the Forum at the next meeting
 - *Mr Gardner was unable to attend the meeting but had spoken with Bob Rajan on the matter. Peter Woolgar gave a verbal feedback on the outcome:*

Although there was concern that biofuels could affect the integrity of protective gloves, any affects were unlikely to be immediate. Due to difficulties in knowing which fuels were present HSE would encourage the same PPE for all fuels - and nitrile, or possibly good quality, non-powdered latex, gloves would probably be sufficient for short term, inadvertent protection. Better gloves would be necessary for deliberate immersion or longer contact.

It was likely that biofuels would be subject to REACH, and in the medium/longer term producers would have to specify precautions for all potential exposures.

Some Forum members were concerned by this approach, and Peter Woolgar requested any information on ill health/dermatitis arising from skin contact with biofuels, to support a possible bid for research into suitable PPE.

Action – Forum members to send any evidence of ill health or dermatitis from exposure to biofuels in MVR to Peter Woolgar

Peter Woolgar to look into the possibility of research and provide an update at next meeting.

- **Mr McLeod's e-mail address to be included in the minutes of the meeting.**
 - *Any member wanting Mr McLeod's email contact details should contact Peter Woolgar*

3) Vehicle Lifts/Ramps

- Geoff Frackelton and Andrew Lake

Geoff Frackelton gave a presentation explaining problems with a design of two post vehicle lift manufactured in China and supplied under a variety of trade names. The main concern was failure of the arm locking mechanism due to the quality of manufacture and of the materials. A small survey by HSE in the North West had identified deficiencies in more than half the lifts of this type that had been encountered - resulting in their use being prohibited until the defects were remedied. He said that the user should check that the arms were properly locked in place before each use.

The following action has been, or will be, taken:-

- SAFED and GEA had been alerted and had issued bulletins to their members

- The UK supplier of one brand had alerted its installers

- HSE will review and update SIM 03/2005/05

Members were invited to inform the bodies they represent of the problem and the precautions that need to be taken.

Andrew Lake spoke about two recent incidents in the industry involving vehicle lifts. The first was a fatal accident to a contractor during repair of a hydraulic ram on a Bradbury 40 Series 4-post lift. A witness maintained that the engineer involved was crouched on the elevated ramp near the controls attached to the post. He then stood up, walked towards his tools and fell – a distance of less than 1.8m. Bradbury's manual suggests this repair should be carried out with ramp at floor level on 100mm blocks. It also makes clear that the ramp should not be used as a working platform. Andrew asked members if working on the raised ramp in this manner was common practice in the industry. Members suggested that it was a short cut and that there was a culture in the industry of trying to get the job done quicker. Peter said the main issue was ensuring that those working at MVR premises, whether employees or contractors, worked in a safe manner.

Andrew then advised of a dangerous occurrence at a two post vehicle lift installed in a garage yard when one of the lifting arm support posts collapsed after bolts that secured it to the ground came away. Fortunately the engineer working on the car being lifted had just walked away and was uninjured. The failure occurred on the side of the lift where there had been a concrete path – of unsuitable grade for the lift installation. Dave Garratt advised that this was contrary to installation specifications.

Andrew then showed examples from MVR workshops run by Eastern European immigrants of unsuitable ramps that were constructed out of breezeblocks and timber.

Peter reminded the Forum that movement of heavy loads/vehicles, including vehicles falling from jacks/supports etc, accounted for about half of the fatal accidents in manufacturing, and asked members to promote the issue of safety in the use of lifts/ramps.

4) Vehicle Rescue/Recovery

- Terry Crampton

Terry gave a presentation on the Recovery Industry Modular Training Scheme - a training scheme for vehicle rescue/recovery operators. The IVR had engaged the Independent Training Standards Scheme and Register (ITSSAR) to develop a scheme to train, certificate and register instructors specifically for the recovery industry.

Peter thanked Terry for his presentation and invited other Forum members to provide presentations on their area of expertise at future meetings.

5) Revision of HSG 62/67

- Andrew Lake

Andrew explained that the route to revision of these publications included a meeting on July 17th last year - when it was assumed that a new priced publication was not an option - it was agreed that HSG 62 & 67 would be updated and merged with a view to publishing them on the website.

Subsequently HSE policy has been revised, and replacements for priced publications will remain as priced items unless there is a good reason to change. In either event a business case is required. Andrew suggested a possible way forward would be a priced publication, a video/DVD, free leaflets and webpage supporting material. Andrew advised that the revised publication would not be in place before April 2009, so had arranged for a limited reprint of HSG 62 & HSG 67 with a 'health warning' that some of the information was out of date. The video (which was out of stock) would not be converted to DVD as there was a possibility of producing a new one.

Peter said he would be approaching members to get illustrations for the leaflet and possibly shots for the new DVD.

Debbie Hutchings asked if there would be a possibility to produce the free leaflet in other languages, eg Polish.

ACTION: Andrew to enquire whether the free leaflets could be produced in other languages.

6) General Updates

- Peter Woolgar

a) HSL Activity on Tyre Fitting

Peter reminded members of the concerns expressed at a previous meeting about some of the information in HSG 62 and that HSL had been commissioned to carry out some research. He and Andrew had met with the research co coordinator, the HSL researchers, and David White from Kwik Fit in November and modified the research requirements. However, the work has not progressed very far, to date. Peter has now been told the work should be completed by March 2009. The outcome will feed into the HSG 62/67 revision.

b) Recent Accidents

Peter advised that of the five fatal accidents in MVR since the last meeting (detailed in the information packs) two involved falls from height, two involved falling heavy loads, and two were to mobile tyre fitters.

He also advised of two other accidents – the first a newspaper report of a coroner's inquest into a fatal accident when a vehicle being driven onto a vehicle lift overshot, came off the end and crushed an employee.

The second accident involved minor injury to a 16 year old on work experience, who was burnt when flammable brake cleaner ignited after it was

sprayed onto a running engine by an experienced mechanic to try to find the source of an oil leak. Paul Cooper advised that non-flammable brake cleaners were available.

7) Update on Bodyshops

a) Example Risk Assessment

- Andrew Lake

Following the introduction of the popular example risk assessment for mechanical repairers, Andrew had developed a draft example for bodyshops. Andrew had consulted Forum members on the draft and thanked them for their comments. He had revised the draft and it should be published fairly soon - it will go onto the HSE website. John Falder asked if he could send the information out to his BCF members now, and Andrew said that was OK if he explained that it was a draft version for comment.

b) Booths Guidance/Automated Clearance Time Indicator

- John Saunders

John Saunders from HSL gave a presentation on research he had been involved in which covered:

- Means of determining the clearance time in booths

- Use/ventilation of booths with pits

- Development of a clearance time indicator

- Spray booth/room guidance

After the presentation the members asked a number of questions, including how often clearance tests should be done? John thought that 'worst case' testing (just before the extract filters need changing) was best, and to repeat the test, say, three times to get a measure of the range of times and select the maximum (having rounded up to the nearest quarter minute). The clearance time should then be checked at the annual thorough examination and test as part of the examination. Some members enquired whether HSE were now requiring a clearance time indicator. Peter advised that if the management systems in place are so good that no one would use the booth without suitable PPE during the clearance time then further controls would be unnecessary, and although John's example clearance time indicator wasn't a legal requirement, (it was research to show their viability) some companies may find them useful to help ensure compliance. He thought that some manufacturers may wish to provide them on new booths.

Some members expressed concern about using a flow switch in the air supply as the timer trigger, as these lines weren't always 'dedicated'. Some members also expressed concern about the cost of the equipment.

d) 3M PPE Initiative

- Alan McArthur

Mr McArthur told members that 3M had been involved in respiratory protection aspects of HSE Motor Vehicle Repair SHAD's since the pilots in 2004. In 2007 following research into the needs of body shops they produced a management guide, a new Safety Directory with basic selection advice and products, Posters and a PPE Health check. He gave a presentation on the 3M work.

8) LEV Project, Application to MVR

- Mark Piney

Mark told members about HSE's Local Exhaust Ventilation (LEV) Project – which included publication of new guidance aimed at suppliers of LEV, employers and employees. A new training course for HSE Inspectors was being rolled out at present. Inspectors attending the course receive a dust lamp, new smoke tubes and an anemometer. Part of the course involved ensuring inspectors knew how to use them properly. The course had received good feedback. The LEV course material is available to stakeholders involved in training and will be provided to trainers who attend Trainer Training Days, to be organised and run by HSL. The project had encouraged the active involvement of supply-side stakeholder groups and a sign-up meeting was planned for 20th May. News and project progress will be reported on HSE's new LEV website (<http://www.hse.gov.uk/lev/index.htm>).

9) Dispelling Industry Myths

- Andrew Lake

a) HF From Viton Seals

Myth 1 – Cars that bite back – Fluoroelastomer seals (e.g. Viton™)
More than 25 years ago a Viton O Ring was heated to 400C in a sealed test rig in a research experiment to check products of decomposition, and a researcher dismantling the rig was contaminated by a clear liquid – now known to be hydrofluoric acid. A deep-seated burn developed, which was not treated, eventually leading to partial amputation of a finger. Viton seals are used in some vehicles and there was lots of publicity regarding dangers to emergency services, vehicle recoverers etc when dealing with burnt out vehicles, usually with the effects of contamination being grossly distorted. Occasionally the myth re-emerges, causing unnecessary concern in the industry. In fact there is no evidence of any problem from vehicles involved in fires - any very small quantities of HF gas probably disperses, or would be washed away by the fire brigade.

b) Clearance Testing Replaces Annual Exam

With the promotion of clearance time testing for spray booths/rooms, at least one company thought that this would replace the requirement for 14 monthly thorough examination and testing. Andrew explained that the legal requirement for the 'annual' examination and test remained.

c) Tax and NI to be Charged on Health Screening?

Andrew advised of three, often confused, types of 'medical':

- 1) Health Screening - identifies employees who might be at risk of ill health;
 - 2) Medical Check-up – limited to determining the employees general state of health;
 - 3) Health surveillance – looking for a specific health effect of chemical exposure - required by COSHH Reg 11.
- 1) and 2) were previously free but HMRC decided it was a taxable benefit unless available to all employees ('Executive Perks!'). But subsequently HMRC revised their interpretation:

- 2 months after introduction HMRC extended concession for 2007/2008

- Following consultation, concession extended for 2008/2009
The decision on 'taxable benefit' never applied to health surveillance. Further details can be found at <http://www.hse.gov.uk/pubns/taxrules.pdf>

10) For Info Items

- Peter Woolgar

a) Euro H&S Week

[The European Campaign for Health and Safety](#), formerly known as 'Euro Health and Safety Week' will this time be a two-year campaign focussing on risk assessment.

The UK's campaign, aimed at employers, workers, safety representatives and other stakeholders, will be officially launched in London on 24 June 2008. Full details of activities and downloadable tools and materials will be available on that date. A number of nationwide events are planned for European Week itself on 20-24 October 2008.

Peter suggested this could be an opportunity for the Forum to promote proper Risk Assessment – and promote the example risk assessments for the industry, he thought that it could be used in Trade Magazines. John Moorcroft said he was already doing this. One member suggested a challenge to the paint industry to get a poster into every body shop before the 1st of November.

b) National Men's Health and Safety Week 2008 (9 to 15 June)

The week, which is organised by the Men's Health Forum and supported by HSE, is focusing on **men's health in the workplace**. More information can be found at:- [HSE Current events - National Men's Health Week 2008](#). Peter thought this was another opportunity for members to promote health issues in MVR.

c) Shattered Lives

The Shattered Lives campaign ran from February to March 2008, but might be extended further due to its success in raising awareness about slips, trips and falls. Although the campaign is not aimed at the MVR industry, Peter thought that some of the messages were relevant. More information can be found at - [Shattered Lives campaign](#)

d) HSE Newsletter – MVR Accidents

The May/June edition of the HSE Newsletter will have a feature on accidents in the Motor Vehicle Repair industry. The yearly subscription for the Newsletter is £20, and there are six editions a year.

e) Proposed Revision of Info for Employees

A census taken of the poster said it was visually unappealing for those with poor vision, learning difficulties or poor language skills. A Consultation Document has been issued proposing to allow HSE to issue alternative posters. Members were invited to comment

f) DWP Select Committee Report

An extract from the DWP Select Committee Report was included in the meeting packs.

11) AoB

- Peter Woolgar

Peter told members he had received an e-mail from the Marketing Director of the Automotive Division of DEB asking if members wanted a presentation on Occupational Dermatitis and MVR. Members said they didn't want another presentation from an outside body at the moment.

Peter thanked members for their participation at the meeting. The next meeting will take place on November 12th 2008 in Birmingham.