

FREEDOM OF INFORMATION STATUS – Fully Open	NUSAC/02/2007																																																						
Nuclear Safety Advisory Committee (NuSAC)	APPROVED																																																						
Minutes of the Open Meeting held on 5 July 2007 at the New Connaught Rooms, 61-65 Great Queen Street, Covent Garden, London WC2B 5DA at 1000 hours.																																																							
<p>Members Present: Steve Vranich (Chair) Sheila Ashford John Billard Robin Bloomfield Andrew Clarke Roger Coates Pam Duerden Bryan Edmondson Paul Haigh Marion Hill Peter Manning Rod McKenzie Neville Moray Alan Muir Gordon Munro Anthony Webb</p> <p>Members Apologies: Dick Bird, Malcolm Bonnett, Barry Cripwell, Bill Heafield, Murray Sinclair</p> <p>In attendance: Robin Dahlberg (HSC) Commissioner Clive Smith (HMS Sultan) Paul Thomas (DNSC Chair)</p> <p>Presenters: John Haddon (COGENT) Ian Hudson (NDA)</p> <p>HSE Officials: Graham Collins (Secretary) Shila Patel (Secretariat) Alma Edwards (Secretariat)</p>	<p>Mike Weightman – HM Chief Inspector of Nuclear Installations (HM CI) Gary Booth – Nuclear Directorate</p> <p>Observers Present: Alan Brandwood(BNG) Mary Morrey (HPA) Bryen Martin (BNFL) Kevan Williams (AWE) John Crofts (UKAEA) Mike Potts (UKAEA) Peter Wakefield (BE) David Mason (BNG) Frank Francis (DRDL) Geoff Gill (Springfields Fuels Ltd) Steve Walsgrave (BERR) Dave Bennett (EA) Andrew McFarlane (MoD) Laurence Williams (NDA) George Hunter (SEPA)</p> <p>Observer Apologies: Louise Robson (BERR) Bobby Ronnie (SE) Jenny Chalmers (URENCO) Heather Young (AWE) Joe McHugh (EA)</p> <p>Acronyms</p> <table border="0"> <tr><td>AWE</td><td>-</td><td>Atomic Weapons Establishment</td></tr> <tr><td>BNFL</td><td>-</td><td>British Nuclear Fuels Ltd</td></tr> <tr><td>BNG</td><td>-</td><td>British Nuclear Group</td></tr> <tr><td>CoRWM</td><td>-</td><td>Committee on Radioactive Waste Management</td></tr> <tr><td>BERR</td><td>-</td><td>Business Enterprise and Regulatory Reform</td></tr> <tr><td>DNSC</td><td>-</td><td>Defence Nuclear Safety Committee</td></tr> <tr><td>DRDL</td><td>-</td><td>Devonport Royal Dockyard Ltd</td></tr> <tr><td>EA</td><td>-</td><td>Environment Agency</td></tr> <tr><td>HPA</td><td>-</td><td>Health Protection Agency</td></tr> <tr><td>HSC</td><td>-</td><td>Health and Safety Commission</td></tr> <tr><td>MoD</td><td>-</td><td>Ministry of Defence</td></tr> <tr><td>ND</td><td>-</td><td>Nuclear Directorate</td></tr> <tr><td>NDA</td><td>-</td><td>Nuclear Decommissioning Authority</td></tr> <tr><td>NII</td><td>-</td><td>Nuclear Installations Inspectorate</td></tr> <tr><td>OCNS</td><td>-</td><td>Office of Civil Nuclear Security</td></tr> <tr><td>SE</td><td>-</td><td>Scottish Executive</td></tr> <tr><td>SEPA</td><td>-</td><td>Scottish Environment Protection Agency</td></tr> <tr><td>UKAEA</td><td>-</td><td>United Kingdom Atomic Energy Authority</td></tr> </table>	AWE	-	Atomic Weapons Establishment	BNFL	-	British Nuclear Fuels Ltd	BNG	-	British Nuclear Group	CoRWM	-	Committee on Radioactive Waste Management	BERR	-	Business Enterprise and Regulatory Reform	DNSC	-	Defence Nuclear Safety Committee	DRDL	-	Devonport Royal Dockyard Ltd	EA	-	Environment Agency	HPA	-	Health Protection Agency	HSC	-	Health and Safety Commission	MoD	-	Ministry of Defence	ND	-	Nuclear Directorate	NDA	-	Nuclear Decommissioning Authority	NII	-	Nuclear Installations Inspectorate	OCNS	-	Office of Civil Nuclear Security	SE	-	Scottish Executive	SEPA	-	Scottish Environment Protection Agency	UKAEA	-	United Kingdom Atomic Energy Authority
AWE	-	Atomic Weapons Establishment																																																					
BNFL	-	British Nuclear Fuels Ltd																																																					
BNG	-	British Nuclear Group																																																					
CoRWM	-	Committee on Radioactive Waste Management																																																					
BERR	-	Business Enterprise and Regulatory Reform																																																					
DNSC	-	Defence Nuclear Safety Committee																																																					
DRDL	-	Devonport Royal Dockyard Ltd																																																					
EA	-	Environment Agency																																																					
HPA	-	Health Protection Agency																																																					
HSC	-	Health and Safety Commission																																																					
MoD	-	Ministry of Defence																																																					
ND	-	Nuclear Directorate																																																					
NDA	-	Nuclear Decommissioning Authority																																																					
NII	-	Nuclear Installations Inspectorate																																																					
OCNS	-	Office of Civil Nuclear Security																																																					
SE	-	Scottish Executive																																																					
SEPA	-	Scottish Environment Protection Agency																																																					
UKAEA	-	United Kingdom Atomic Energy Authority																																																					

MINUTES OF NUSAC OPEN MEETING HELD ON 5 JULY 2007

1 Welcome and Introduction

- 1.1 The Chair welcomed Robin Dahlberg, Health and Safety Commissioner who represents the public interest on the Commission. He also introduced Commander Clive Smith (HMS Sultan, the Royal Navy's Training School), John Haddon (COGENT), Ian Hudson (NDA), Steve Walsgrave (Observer), BERR, representing Louise Robson, Kevan Williams(ObsERVER), AWE, representing Heather Young, Dave Bennett (Observer), EA representing Joe McHugh, and Mike Potts(ObsERVER), UKAEA replacing John Crofts. The Chair also welcomed members of the public to observe NuSAC's first Open meeting.
- 1.2 The Chair on behalf of the Health and Safety Commission thanked Neville Moray for his dedication and experience in the 2 terms he served as a member of NuSAC. He also paid tribute to Jim Whiston who was honoured in the Queen's Birthday Honours 2007.

2 Notes of the meeting held on 22 March 2007

With the following amendments:

- Para 1.1 "Morray" should be "Moray".
- Para 4.3 , line 3 delete "about" and add "an additional".
- Para 4.3, line 3 amend to "The Chief Inspector said that an additional 40 inspectors. were likely to be needed to undertake.".....
- Para 4.3, line 4 should be "resources were being gained from other parts of HSE".....
- Para 5.1, 4th bullet point after "sustained," add "the importance of which is shown in the NII's report".
- Para 8.2, last bullet point, second line, change "unfair" to "unwelcome".
- Para 10.3, line 1, after "expressed" put "the view". Para 11.4, insert "legal" in "regulatory requirements".
- Para 11.4, insert "legal" in "regulatory requirements".
- Action 5/3/2006, third para, 3 line 5, after "more" add "resource".
- Action 4/1/2007 to read: "Dr Weightman and Mr Mason agreed to return to the Committee in October 2007 to each make a presentation on the 'lessons learnt' from the Thorp incident.

The minutes were approved.

3 Actions Arising

All actions had been cleared except:

(a) Action 1/1/2007: HSE to report on progress with the development of national policy on management/disposal of Plutonium Contaminated Material (PCM)

Mike Weightman gave an update on DEFRA's consultation on long-term management of radioactive waste published on 25 June 2007. He explained that PCM was considered by CoRWM whose Recommendations were accepted in October 2006. HSE is working with EA and SEPA to produce joint guidance on management of radioactive waste. Peter Manning agreed the need to consider how to treat PCM for disposal. A

presentation from UKAEA was offered.

NEW ACTION 1/2/2007: Mike Potts, UKAEA to agree a date with NuSAC Secretariat to give a presentation on PCM.

(b) Action 2/1/2007: Graham Collins to provide a progress report on the insolvency administrator's remit.

Graham Collins reported that he had discussed this with HSE's legal adviser. The legal responsibilities under HSWA of an administrator or receiver will depend on the degree of control they have over safety matters. He suggested a paper to explore these issues at the next meeting.

NEW ACTION 2/2/2007: Graham Collins to prepare a paper on Insolvency for the October 2007 meeting.

(c) Action 4/1/2007: Correction to this Action to read: "Dr Weightman as well as Mr Mason agreed to return to the Committee in October 2007 to each make a presentation on the 'lessons learnt' from the Thorp incident'.

Mike Weightman and David Mason each to present 'the lessons learnt from the Thorp incident at the October 2007 meeting.

(d) Action 5/1/2007: The Chair to write to HSE Chief Scientist inviting him to make a presentation to a future meeting on his views on the best use of science. Chair to write before the October 2007 meeting.

(e) Action 6/1/2007: DTI to make a presentation to a future meeting on their vision for the National Nuclear Laboratory. Action Ongoing.

(f) Action 7/1/2007: Mr Mason to provide a paper on dose control and use of ALARP at Sellafield. Action ongoing: This item is on the agenda for the October 2007 meeting.

(g) Action 8/1/2007: The Chair to write to the Safety Directors' Forum to enquire about the reasons why contractor injury rates are higher than for employees. **Action ongoing: Chair to write before the October 2007 meeting.**

4 Presentation of the Annual Review of NuSAC up to Spring 2007

4.1 The Chair presented the Annual Review for Spring 2007. The aim is to produce such reports annually in the future. Following discussions, the subsequent amendments were agreed:

Page 4, bullet point 3: instead of "agree a coordinated plan for placing plutonium contaminated material" change to "encouraged development of a coordinated plan".

Page 6, Industry/Government Observers: remove Health Protection Agency from "Industry Observers" and place under "Government Observers".

ACTION 3/2/2007: The Secretariat to amend the NuSAC Review 2007 with the details listed in the paragraph above, before it is placed on the internet.

5 Nuclear Safety Performance (update on HSE's policy and operational issues) and wider issues

5.1 Mike Weightman introduced his report NuSAC (2007) P8 and highlighted key points from the report around reorganisation of NII, the generic design assessment work and operational issues. He also provided an update on matters arising after the report had been finalised. He asked for general feedback on this report as a means of continuous improvement with regard to openness.

5.2 Roger Coates asked about the current position on NDA funding and how NDA proposes to ensure safety and retain skills. He also queried whether the funding level was sufficient not to affect nuclear safety in allowing the SLCs to meet their regulatory obligations.

5.3 David Mason added that funding was a pressure for Sellafield Ltd, particularly to meet the specifications on legacy ponds and silos. He added that difficult and balanced judgements were being made in the circumstances, but cannot guarantee that safety will not be impacted.

5.4 Laurence Williams replied that there had been redistribution of funding between sites, but the overall level of funding was being maintained and was expected to increase. Regulatory requirements for nuclear safety were always the first priority for funding. Where cuts had been made they were to work programmes that were not related to existing or potential future regulatory requirements. It is inevitable that low hazard sites and facilities (eg defuelled reactors) receive less funding than those where hazards are higher (eg legacy ponds and silos at Sellafield). The 2006 NDA process of redistributing funds had been unsatisfactory for SLCs and NDA had learned the lessons. Laurence Williams would report to the Committee on proposed future arrangements when the NDA was clearer about its likely budget for 2008/9 and the next two years.

ACTION 4/2/2007: Laurence Williams agreed to report to the Committee in October on the funding situation, as the published accounts will be available then.

5.5 Peter Manning queried the indefinite storage of AGR fuel at Sellafield. Laurence Williams reported that the NDA strategy provided for a review of spent fuel. NDA are examining the Consultants' Report on Spent Fuel and will make available the findings.

ACTION 5/2/2007: Laurence Williams to report to the Committee when NDA have taken a view on the Consultants' report on spent fuel management.

6 Activities of NuSAC Review Groups

(a) Review Group 1 (Safety Management and Performance) - Andrew Clarke reported on a joint visit with Review Group 3 to Hinkley Point A and that the same members would shortly visit Hunterston A. It was intended to present a compare and contrast report - as both these sites have different management structures - to a future meeting of the Committee. RG1 would shortly be visiting Dounreay and had received an invitation from UKAEA to receive an update on the Windscale Piles project. Members of RG1 would also be visiting Sizewell B before the next meeting to discuss their "learning

from experience” programme.

(b) Review Group 2 (Fuel Cycle and Operations and Interim Safety) - Marion Hill reported plans to visit Capenhurst regarding the Uranium hexafluoride tails and whether they should be converted to uranium oxide, which is more suitable for long term storage.

(c) Review Group 3 (Nuclear Decommissioning Policy) – Anthony Webb reported on coordinated visit with RG1 to Hinkley Point A. A further coordinated visit to Dounreay with RG1 was planned at the end of the month. Following on from the earlier meeting with Terry Selby to discuss NDA strategy, a further meeting is due to take place in the autumn.

(d) Review Group 4 (Emergency Arrangements) – Rod McKenzie reported on the following main areas:

- Lessons learnt from nuclear incidents, cross-fertilisation from other follow-up reports such as from the Buncefield incident and how contingency planning in general is changing in response to the Civil Contingency Act - including the role of the Nuclear Emergency Planning Liaison Group (NEPLG) in amending guidance on nuclear accident response, including for the communication of public and media information.
- Continued discussions with MoD on the role of the Military or MoD Co-ordinating Authority (MCA) and the responsibility for advising on safety countermeasures and public safety. The group plans to attend the Level 3 exercise at Devonport in October and visit Vulcan Naval Reactor Test Establishment (NRTE), submarine nuclear reactor test facility near Dounreay.

(e) Review Group 5 (Ministry of Defence): Pam Duerden reported on behalf of Dick Bird and presented their activities in the last reporting period:

- To give members an understanding of the operations and issues at some defence nuclear sites. This involved two visits to Rolls Royce (Derby) and Devonport.
- The group was encouraged by a strong drive to improve safety performance.
- Steve Vranich reported on the outcome of his and Dick Bird’s meeting with Defence Nuclear Safety Committee Chair. The aim of the meeting was to gain an understanding of each other’s work in particular; the remit of NuSAC’s newly set up Task Forces; and the issues relating to the management of waste.

(f) Review Group 6 (Research) - Peter Manning reported:

- on the Group reviews of research that is included in the Nuclear Research Index (NRI), which is reactor-orientated;
- that HSE had followed and addressed the criticism from the Group on the NRI;
- that the Group had also broadened its scope to review research in the non-reactor areas.

7 Training of NII inspectors

Mike Weightman reported NII’s Learning and Development project, which aims to ensure the level of competence required to operate in the regulatory system. NII have recruited 10 inspectors from the rest of HSE but expects to lose significant numbers and

experience to retirement in the next five years. This, together with the plans to recruit new inspectors, necessitate a revitalised approach to training and development.

8 The work of Cogent

John Haddon gave a presentation on the work of Cogent, the Sector Skills Council for the nuclear, chemical, oil and gas, petroleum and polymer industries. He explained Cogent's remit and aim to produce a competent workforce with transferable skills in the current declining trend of students taking science subjects. Cogent and the planned National Skills Academy for the Nuclear industry will work together to address the skills gap through:

- research on future gaps between supply and demand
- improving processes in the education sector and the provision of training and development
- developing national occupational standards and qualifications with employers.

9 Update on training skills: NDA

Ian Hudson gave an update on progress with developing the NDA's skills strategy. He outlined the key drivers for the strategy and the need for workforce planning and transition plans, skills maintenance and development plans. Key specialist skills shortages included project control engineers, quantity surveyors, environmental specialists, health physics advisors and safety case writers and reviewers.

9.1 The following points arose from the discussions on the three presentations on training:

- Members were encouraged by the work of Cogent in relations to the skills gap. Both NDA and Cogent were invited to update NuSAC at future meetings.
- Cogent aims to maintain the whole picture and monitor progress on the skills gap.
- Cogent are interested in NuSAC's interface group and wish to have further discussions with Anthony Webb.
- Once the Nuclear Skills Academy for the Nuclear industry is opened, there will be more delivery as companies engage in economic and training activities.

10 Members of the public were invited to put questions to NuSAC on nuclear safety. Topics discussed included possible construction developments near nuclear sites; approaches to informing people near nuclear sites of emergency arrangements; and operational safety issues concerning specific nuclear sites.

11 Date of next meeting

The next meeting will be held at the Low Wood Hotel, Windermere, Cumbria, LA23 1LP at 0900 hours on 26 October.