

**AGRICULTURAL INDUSTRY ADVISORY COMMITTEE
TRANSPORT PROJECT GROUP**

Summary of 2nd workshop held on 8 March 2006 at NFU Mutual, Stratford-upon-Avon.

Present:

Alan Plom (Chair)	HSE - Agriculture & Food Sector
David Leavesley	NFU Mutual
Jake Vowles	Agricultural Engineers Association (AEA)
Tim Drew	Lantra
Ian Beeby	TGWU
Ken Hardgrave	Agricultural Industries Confederation (AIC)
Andy Scarlett	Scarlett Research Ltd
Moira Buchan	HSE - Workplace Transport Programme
Tony Mitchell	HSE - Agriculture & Food Sector

1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

1.1 Alan Plom thanked David Leavesley/NFU Mutual for hosting the meeting and welcomed new members Ian Beeby (Chair of TGWU's H&S Committee) and Ken Hardgrave (Chair of the AIC's Transport Group). Apologies received from Marcus Themans (NFU) and Alan Mendelson (DfT) and unfortunately Ian Jones (BAGMA) and Nigel Davey (IoSH/Consultant) were both unable to attend as they had last minute 'transport-related' crises.

1.2 This second Agricultural Transport workshop was intended to build on the discussions at the first workshop held on 8 August 2005, to identify relevant activities and any progress made since that meeting and to confirm the draft Workplan and priorities for the AIAC Transport Project Group. The discussion would also inform and help to develop HSE's transport-related projects. Dr Andy Scarlett (ex-Silsoe Research Institute and research contractor for HSE, other Government Departments and manufacturers) was invited to review relevant research and future information needs. Moira Buchan was present to outline HSE's Workplace Transport Programme and feed back members' activities to the Programme Team.

2. HSE'S STRUCTURE, STRATEGY AND PROGRAMMES

2.1 Alan recapped on the Programme and Project structure in HSE, set up under HSE's "Fit for work, fit for life, fit for the future" (Fit3) Strategic Programme to help deliver HSE's PSA targets. These are to reduce fatal and major injuries (by 3%), work-related ill health (6%) and days lost due to work-related injuries and ill health (9%), all by 2007/08. The activities of the AIAC's Agriculture Transport Project Group and its members supports 'Fit3' and the Workplace Transport Programme in particular.

2.2 The Group's draft Workplan for 2005-08 (v4) had been revised to incorporate the potential contributions of the various stakeholders identified at the last workshop and to reflect the AIAC's own targets, which are based on the average of injuries reported between 1999/2000 and 2003/04 (as opposed to a single year under HSE's PSA/Fit3 targets, to allow for the variations and significant under-reporting of injuries in agriculture).

2.3 The AIAC's targets for the industry are:

- A reduction in fatal accident incident rate to employees - 20% by 2008;
- A reduction in fatal accident incident rate to self employed - 10% by 2008;
- A reduction in major accident incident rate to employees - 20% by 2008;
- A reduction in the incidence rate of cases of work-related ill health – 10% by 2008.

2.4 Jake reported that he and others had written to HSE (Dr Gibby/Chair of AIAC) and HSC's Chairman expressing their concern about the proposed reduction in the communications budget for agriculture. They were particularly concerned that this would reduce the number of Safety Health and Awareness Days that could be run. Members agreed that 'communications' and sharing good practice was vital to the work of the Group. Members also expressed their concern about the apparent further decrease in support from HSE reflected by a reduced commitment to inspection, which they consider critical in influencing the industry.

2.5 The members present requested that the Chair send a "strong letter" to Dr Gibby (as Director of HSE's Injury Reduction Programme and Chair of AIAC), using the following words: "It is a tragedy that HSE is not prepared to support SHADs to a reasonable extent, when its own research has shown that this is a most cost-effective method of influencing farmers and others. This is the public vehicle by which this Project will have a significant impact, and failure to allocate sufficient funds for 2006/07 will undermine the work of the Group. The impact will be further reduced with less inspector resources being allocated to HSE's own Transport projects, in particular the peak activity inspection campaigns and joint enforcement initiative with VOSA."

ACTION: A Plom – *[Done and discussed at AIAC in March 2006; it has been announced that HSE intend to fund 24 SHADs for the self-employed and smaller family farms.]*

3. REVIEW OF NOTES & ACTIONS FROM 1st WORKSHOP (12.8.05)

3.1 The draft notes (v2) of the last meeting were accepted and will be placed on the 'open' AIAC page on HSE's website. Actions and matters arising noted included:

Min 3.3 Latest stats – The latest (injury) stats for 2004-05 were sent to AIAC members at the end of Jan 2006. Members felt they had to wait too long for this information and it was too detailed. They need more frequent and accurate updates to use and publicise the information. Alan explained these have to be verified by HSE Stats Branch (COSAS) before release. **ACTION** – *HSE Ag Sector to note this view and pass request on. [DONE]*

Min 4.2 HSE Agriculture Transport Project 'route maps' – Alan had received no comments on the draft 'Intervention Logic Models' or 'Route Maps' (summarising the 3 elements of the Project), e-mailed to delegates after the last meeting.

[Chairs note - These were presented to AIAC as 'a useful tool' to help explain the significance of different activities and inter-relationship between various stakeholders involved in delivery (eg BAGMA, VOSA, AEA, etc) and have now been placed on the (open) AIAC website.]

Min 4.2 HSE/VOSA inspection information - Tony Mitchell to present information on the HSE/VOSA inspection initiatives and HSE enforcement activities under agenda item 4.

Min 4.3 Food Chain Project – Invitation to send any information relevant to Bruno Porter’s Food Chain still stands. ***ACTION - Members***

Min 4.7 Braking research - DfTr had agreed to joint fund the proposed research with HSE, but this proposal was now held in abeyance due to a moratorium on HSE’s research, whilst HSE’s priorities and budget were being clarified. *[Discussed under Item 5 - Research.]*

Min 4.10 Whole Body Vibration (WBV) Research - Selection of routes to reduce exposure of operators to WBV should be incorporated in any future guidance on managing transport operations. *[Chair’s Note: No specific HSE guidance is planned at this stage but this could be included in HSE’s ‘Tractor Action’ leaflet when next amended.]*

Min 5.1.2 Base-line data - BAGMA’s proposal to collect data on condition of vehicles on-farm has been commissioned by HSE *[See para 4.17 below.]*

Min 5.1.5 Licensing of ATV’s & Sales of Unsuitable Equipment on e-Bay - AEA are still waiting for DfT to clarify the classification of ATV’s. AEA’s Outdoor Powered Equipment Committee (OPEC) had arranged an ‘ATV Open Day’ at Stoneleigh to discuss these issues and demonstrate the EASI Training Scheme on 16/3/06. HSE are due to meet DTI to discuss sales of machines through e-Bay and liaison with HM Revenue & Customs + Trading Standards Depts, on 17/3/06. ***ACTION - HSE [Ongoing]***

Min 5.1.9 FISHNet – Nigel Davey’s details sent to Brian Coggans (HSE’s Food Section). Nigel is the chair of FISHNet (the Food Industry Safety & Health Network in East Anglia). Not known if Nigel contacted yet (as he was unable to attend the workshop).

Min 6.1 Communications - NFU Mutual to respond to AEA and share information on accidents, in particular costs. *[See item 5].* HSE are also pursuing this with other insurers and intend to organise a conference for major insurers and financial institutions.

Min 6.1 Safe Vehicles (Brake testing) – Meeting held with DfT and interested parties at Silsoe on 15/9/05 to discuss braking systems and performance. A simple easily repeatable test protocol is still needed to measure efficiency of tractor/trailer combinations. *[See item 6.]*

Min 6.1 Safe Driver – Ian Beeby (TGWU) offered to use his contacts to place an article in ‘Bike’ magazine highlighting the prevalence of accidents involving motorcycles overtaking tractors turning right. ***ACTION: Ian Beeby.***

Min 6.1 Evaluation - BAGMA had prepared a project proposal to collect baseline data from farms. This is to be joint funded by HSE and DfT. *[Commissioned – See item 4.17]*

Min 7.3 AIAC Project Group Workplan – The objectives were revised and circulated with the notes of the 1st Workshop, before submitted to AIAC in November. Following AIAC, they were further amended to incorporate AIAC’s agreed targets (See v4revd). All members were asked to identify ways in which their organisations can (and will) contribute, and to inform Alan Plom, asap. This invitation still stands. ***ACTION – All members.***

Min 7.4 – Membership - Mike Simpson (NAAC) had been sent the previous papers and invitation to the meetings but had not responded.

***ACTION** – Alan Plom (& Jake) to follow up with NAAC. [Jill Hewitt (NAAC's DG) to receive papers too.]*

4. REVIEW OF ACTIVITIES

Delegates gave an update on progress of relevant activities, following the order in the Notes of the last meeting:

HSE

4.1 **Agriculture Transport Project** - Tony Mitchell (Project Manager) reiterated how this project contributes to the 3 themes of HSE's overarching Workplace Transport Programme, ie "Safe Site, Safe Vehicle, Safe Driver" and outlined progress on the 3 workstreams:

- **Peak Activity Inspection Campaign** – Detailed information was not yet available on HSE's field inspection activities. However, this was unlikely to be as extensive or comprehensive as anticipated due to the introduction of the new project-based planning system at the beginning of the year and a change in HSE's computer work/contact recording system later in the year.
- **Joint Enforcement Initiatives** – The proposed 12 one-day HSE/VOSA (Vehicle and Operator Services Agency) roadside-checks had also been affected by the new planning arrangements in HSE, although some areas had delivered more than others. This project (themed "Safe on-road, Safe off-road") was intended to run during the harvest period. In response to NFU's concerns expressed at AIAC, the Sector had advised HSE's inspection teams to inform their local NFU Secretaries of planned local spot checks. However, it was also widely publicised nationally and at the local level following the issue of a press release (by Tony) in July. Tony was interviewed and quoted in trade journals, local press and radio. In fact, HSE's independent communications survey recorded this topic as attracting the highest coverage of any HSE-issued publicity over that period.

Nb. VOSA had recently released some interesting and worrying statistics from their inspections of farm vehicles on the road last year. [See item 5.]

- **Influencing through the Supply Chain** – All 6 dealer seminars delivered as planned, as they involved BAGMA and the Ag Sector directly, although HSE's field staff had supported the seminars locally. Response from attendees had been very positive and they had commonly asked for the audience to be expanded. These seminars will be evaluated, but meanwhile more are planned next year using a similar format. BAGMA have confirmed that the seminars are raising awareness (and use) of the Vehicle Health Check Scheme by their dealers, which will in turn promote improved maintenance of vehicles.

4.2 **Food Chain Project** – Bruno Porter (Project manager) was unable to attend, but Ken Hargrave (AIC) reported on Bruno's involvement with the AIC and some of its member companies. This initiative was beginning to engage businesses in the food processing and supply chain who are capable of influencing farmers. Alan Plom had also given a presentation on the project to the AIC's Transport Group, together with Tony Mitchell and John Berezansky (from HSE's Transport Sector), who outlined their respective projects.

***ACTION** – All Members to send to Bruno/HSE any information to help produce and promote the business case for h&s, in particular, examples of actual costs/benefits of avoiding breakdowns and*

consequent delays in production, processing and delivery.

4.3 **Safety and Health Awareness Days (SHADs)** - These are being delivered as part of a 3-year "Self-employed and Family Farms" project (managed by Alan). SHADs are now the main route by which HSE reaches small farms. They have been widely used by HSE and research has endorsed their effectiveness. Up to 24 SHADs were originally proposed for each of the 3 years of this project, together with local 'novel interventions', intended to identify and try out new and effective ways of influencing farmers. Most HSE Divisions had run one or more 'novel interventions' and a total of 17 SHADs had been organised around the country during 2005-06, the first year of this project. (In Scotland, 4 proposed smaller events had been merged into 2 larger SHADs).

4.4 As discussed under item 3, due to the proposed reduction in the communications budget for agriculture, only 6 events were planned in 2006-07. However, the Sector intended to approach potential sponsors such as insurance companies, larger employers and land-owners to support and help maintain the programme. In 2006-07 the number of scenarios will be reduced from 7 to 6, in response to a common request in 'exit polls' from farmers who want more time to ask questions. This would also enable more events to be funded.

4.5 Several independent evaluation exercises have been carried out by researchers over the years and all had endorsed Ag SHADs to be a cost-effective intervention method. Bomel Consultants Ltd had also carried out a further survey in 2005 to evaluate actual improvements made on farms, using their 'Barometer of Culture Change' tool. Jake reiterated that he and Jill Hewitt (Director of the NAAC and a fellow member of the AIAC) had written to Dr Gibby seeking HSE's continued support for these events, in response to a letter Madge Moore (Director of Lantra) sent to the HSC Chairman. Members confirmed their strong view that SHADs should continue to be supported and endorsed the text for the letter previously drafted and agreed by the meeting.

***ACTION** – A Plom to send letter to Dr Gibby. [Done; additional events to be funded.]*

Department for Transport

4.6 **Tractor/trailer braking guidance** - At the 1st workshop, Alan Mendelson (DfT) undertook to clarify the complex legal requirements on agricultural tractor/trailer braking and to rationalise the available guidance. Unfortunately, this has not been produced and Alan M was unable to attend this meeting. As he retires at the end of March and the DfT appear to be withdrawing from 'agriculture', the industry fears this key guidance will not see the light of day. This guidance is important to the industry and regulators alike, including HSE, as it will support the "Safe On Road - Safe Off Road" joint-enforcement initiative with VOSA. Ken Hardgrave (AIC) also identified this as being particularly useful for his members, as they have a key role in managing road transport and have a legal duty to prevent overloading of (farm) vehicles at feed mills, etc.

***ACTION** – DfT - A simple Guidance Sheet on tractor/trailer weight limits, licensing and braking requirements is needed for farmers and contractors, feed mills, transport companies, etc.*

[Chairs Note – Andy Scarlett produced a useful summary note after the meeting – See 6.6 below.]

4.7 **Road accident research** – A meeting to discuss the findings of Richard Gard's study of road accidents involving agricultural vehicles (sponsored by DfT) on 15 March has been cancelled. This had confirmed the major cause of serious accidents was farm vehicles turning right from highways during transport operations. Approx 30 members of the public and 10 farmers/employees are killed each year. David Leavesley confirmed that a high proportion of the public killed were motor cyclists. Defective lighting, trafficators and warning signs were also major factors. It was hoped that the final year of this study would provide additional detailed

analysis. **ACTION – HSE/AEA** - *Information to be obtained from DfT/R Gard.*

AEA

4.8 **Support from DfT/DTI** - The AEA is concerned about the lack of support for the agricultural equipment industry from Government Departments generally, particularly from DTI and DfT. Jake suggested UK has become "the football of Europe" because we are often under-represented at European and International meetings, eg at a recent critical OECD meeting there was no official UK rep and the AEA rep present did not have the right to vote. A rep (from DfT) who attended previously abstained because he was unsure of the issues and line to take. This would be avoided if the AEA were formally delegated to represent UK, eg at OECD, CATP and on the Machinery Directive's Art 6.2 Committee.

[Chair's note –This was discussed with DTI on 17 March. The latter is not possible due to the constitution of the Art 6.2 Committee under the Directive. This Committee is for Public Bodies only, but there are Working Groups which can be attended by organisations such as the AEA, CEN, etc The AEA may also present papers to seek clarification. However, it is pointed out that tractors and road trailers do not come up under Art 6.2 as these are outside the scope of the Machinery Directive, being covered by the Tractors Directive. This is under review over the next few years when it will cover ALL risks, including off-road and general use. Nb. The DTI will also consider the AEA's representations.]

4.9 **Standards work** - This area of work is becoming ever-more critical as issues such as braking and cab filtration are being discussed and determined in European Standards and ISO Committees and at OECD. UK must be adequately represented in order to influence the outcomes and future standards. This has important implications for UK companies and regulators alike, yet not all are funded by DTI and the AEA does not have the funds to attend all the necessary meetings. HSE has limited resources and is unable to fund others to attend meetings. The Ag Sector has started to identify key/priority standards/topics needing HSE input to preserve or improve the level of safety. **ACTION – A Plom** to forward relevant information/correspondence to DTI. *[Chairs note – Meeting held between DTI/HSE]*

4.10 **Vehicle Licensing/Classification and Implementation of Directives** - The AEA is in dispute with DfT about the resources available to resolve their issues and subsequent policy, eg on the classification and definition of agricultural vehicles (ATVs and 'fast tractors' in particular). The AEA has also pointed out numerous times that the UK Construction and Use Regs are not only lagging behind Europe, but also in direct conflict with Directives. DVLA had referred this back to DfT. The AEA is frustrated because it feels its voice is going unheard.

4.11 These issues are also relevant to HSE, as they have implications for braking systems and other protective devices (for operators and others who may be exposed to risk during transport activities on and off-farms, ie on the road). HSE could not support changes in legislation to permit increases in speed or weight without commensurate improvements in braking requirements.

4.12 The AEA has already complained about the lack of support from Government Departments to the Minister (Dr Stephen Ladyman) and the Better Regulation Commission/Cabinet Office, but Jake feels that wider support from HSE and other Government Departments/Regulators would be useful in drawing attention to the situation and gaining support from the relevant Department(s)/Agencies.

4.13 Jake was also concerned about the lack of coordination between various Government

Departments. This leads to duplication and overlap between various Committees, including HSE, DTI and DfT (eg on Whole Body Vibration and Hand-arm Vibration from machines used in construction as well as in agriculture and forestry). Consequently, the AEA's Board is contemplating its contribution and involvement and is considering withdrawing from those which show no return for their involvement.

***ACTION – A Plom.** Members present agreed unanimously that the Chair should write to DTI/DfT reflecting these concerns.[Chairs Note - Meeting held between HSE/DfT and the AEA continue to lobby Departments through MP's and Ministers.]*

4.14 **ATVs (Mis-use/advertising and EASI Training Scheme)** – In addition to the vehicle licensing/classification issues reported under minute 4.10, AEA continue to highlight and publicise mis-use and inappropriate advertising of ATVs, eg displaying inadequate ppe being worn by riders, or unsuitable equipment (eg ROPS) advertised for fitting to ATV's and HSE has successfully pursued and resolved several issues reported by AEA. The AEA's ATV manufacturer/supplier members are promoting driver training through the USA-originated EASI Scheme. This was being launched at OPEC's Open Day at Stoneleigh Park on 16 March. A Plom and Jason Liggins from HSE were attending. AEA had invited Lantra to the meeting, but they had not responded. EASI are willing to talk to appropriate Lantra Awards-registered instructors about the scheme however. DfT, DVLA, VCA and other Departments had also been invited to the Open Day, but it was feared they would not turn up.

BAGMA

4.15 **Dealer seminars** - Ian Jones was unable to attend, so Tony reported on the series of seminars (described at 4.1) held around the country. Ian, Tony and other HSE staff outline the legal requirements under HSWA s6, raising their awareness of the full extent of their duties, including the supply of second-hand machines. Feedback has shown the Seminars have all been well-received and a further 6 are planned in 2006-07.

4.16 **Vehicle Health Check Scheme (VHCS)** - BAGMA are training their members' engineers to carry out inspections under the VHCS as well as under PUWER and LOLER. BAGMA have also developed and are promoting their 'installation scheme', which will provide standardised training for operators of new machines.

4.17 **Baseline research** - BAGMA's proposed research, using their dealer members to collect data on the condition of (420) tractors and (105) trailers on-farm, had been commissioned by HSE just before a moratorium on HSE's research had been imposed. The survey would be completed in October 2006. The findings would be indicative and highlight key problems/aspect to focus on in future, as well as providing a basis to evaluate the impact of HSE's Agriculture Transport project .

NFU Mutual

4.18 David Leavesley and the Director of Risk Management Services Ltd had met recently with Alan Plom and Roger Nourish (Head of HSE's Ag & Food Sector) to discuss the potential for closer working, particularly for sharing information, publicity and sponsorship. He had since analysed the cost of some accident claims. [See item 5.]

4.19 'Associa' – the former 'NFU Services' and jointly funded by NFU and NFU Mutual – are producing business guides for a range of enterprises. They would be an effective avenue to get information out.

Lantra

4.20 Tim Drew outlined the Sector Skills Council's recently restructured Industry Committees, set up to take a strategic view. These included most stakeholders involved in the Project Group (including HSE, AEA and BAGMA). Lantra are working with interested organisations to develop National Occupational Standards. Transfer of knowledge was vital to improve training, eg the findings of HSE's research identifying what triggers individuals to take action could be usefully incorporated into training strategies. The demise of ADAS - the advisory and extension services in agriculture - was not helpful and other methods are needed to promote good practice. He was particularly interested in the OPEC ATV Open Day and EASI training scheme.

TGWU

4.21 Ian Beeby (Chair of TGWU's Agriculture H&S Committee and one of TGWU's original Roving Safety Reps, and previously a member of AIAC's Health in Agriculture Committee), has been involved in many local shows and events with HSE and others, particularly promoting Transport safety and Child Safety. He writes the regular H&S column in TGWU's Landworker and can publicise the issues raised through this monthly journal. He is also an Advanced Motorcycle instructor and offered to place an article in 'Bike' magazine on the prevalence of motorcycle accidents involving farm vehicles on the road.

HSE - Workplace Transport Programme

4.22 Moira Buchan (HSE Programme Team) outlined HSE's overarching Transport Programme and its various projects. Opportunities were being taken to link these with other priority topics. Of particular interest and relevance to the Group were the Transport Management Standards being developed by HSE. Some farmers had been consulted in developing these standards.

4.23 Some other projects focussed more narrowly, eg on the manufacturing and services sectors, identified as key areas to help deliver HSE's PSA targets. These incorporated smaller projects aimed at vulnerable groups, such as 'Moving Goods Safely' which was targeting delivery drivers in the supermarket and white goods supply chain, by tackling manual handling, slips and trips and falls, as well as transport issues.

4.24 New regulations had been considered but discounted, in favour of developing the management standards and promoting simple across-the-board messages and 'non-technical' solutions which would be included in guidance, eg a "Ten Top Tips for Delivery Drivers", recommending improving lighting, pedestrian/vehicle segregation, hi-vis jackets, etc. 4 main areas had been identified in workshops:

- site layout/design;
- vehicle selection and maintenance;
- personnel issues (including driver competence, fitness and visiting (foreign + agency) drivers), and
- management responsibilities (risk assessment, managing contractors, etc).

4.25 The draft standards are to be issued for consultation soon, probably between June and November 2006. It is intended to launch these in March 2007, linked with a major publicity campaign. It would be important to tie this in with agricultural campaigns and linked to training. Further information is available on the HSE website.

4.26 Tim Drew was concerned because this was the first he had heard of these Standards, even though he works for the Sector Skills Council. Lantra are developing the National Occupational Standards to implement the European Driver Training Directive being introduced in 2009.

***ACTION** – Moira Buchan to inform her colleague leading on this in the WPT Programme.*

Agriculture Industries Confederation (AIC)

4.27 Ken Hardgrave outlined the membership of the AIC and its own Transport Group. The NFU's Marcus Themans and Lisa Wise were members of their Group, but neither had attended recent meetings. The AIC's members mainly include feed millers and suppliers (ex-UKASTA), but their individual member companies are involved in a much wide range of activities. For example, Ken's own company (LKL) provided some 400 agency staff, including relief milkers and other farm staff.

4.28 Ken had analysed accidents within his own group of companies to identify priority areas for attention. These would provide some interesting case studies for publicity purposes. Ken would present these at a meeting scheduled with HSE on 10 March. They had identified a particular need for training in use of ATVs for their contract staff and requested contacts for EASI and Lantra training. Most of AIC's members are involved in haulage so will find the proposed 'Management Standards' particularly useful.

***ACTION** – AIC to share accident information with HSE and encourage members to comment on the consultation document.*

4.29 The AIC are particularly interested in ensuring commonality and consistency of advice and enforcement, between regulators (including LAs) across the country. Guidance and help is needed from HSE to solve problems and inconsistencies at some storage plants and mills. Supervision of loading and sheeting of vehicles is a particular difficult issue – this is being dealt with differently - between companies, within companies at different sites and differently between industries. For example, some companies do not allow drivers to stand (in a safe area) alongside their vehicles to supervise loading, yet the driver is responsible for their loads when on the road. Some sites even require drivers to move their vehicles off-site before sheeting them, to avoid the occupiers being held liable in the event of the driver falling off the vehicle/load.

***ACTION** – AIC to (continue to) liaise with relevant HSE Sectors.*

National Association of Agricultural Contractors (NAAC)

4.30 Unfortunately no representative was present, but Alan reported that HSE considered NAAC to be a key 'stakeholders' and Jill Hewitt (DG) is an active member of the HSC's Agricultural Industry Advisory Committee. NAAC members are involved in a wider range of contracting activities than just agriculture, including landscaping/amenity work, highways maintenance and road transport. They therefore have a particular interest in many of the issues discussed and Alan would be discussing these with Jill, as part of developing an 'agreement' with the NAAC. In particular, there could be opportunities for closer working together, eg running Safety and Health Awareness Days for their members.

***ACTION** – HSE/NAAC to discuss SHADs for contractors.*

4. THE CURRENT PICTURE - UPDATE

Latest Statistics

5.1 **RIDDOR stats** - Tony Mitchell reviewed the latest injury statistics for 2004-05 (released in January) and other available information. A total of 480 transport-related accidents in agriculture had been reported between 2001-05. These caused 64 deaths, 219 major injuries and 197 over 3-day injuries. 37% of all fatalities in agriculture are related to transport activities, with a significant peak during the harvest period. 63 deaths (22%) of these deaths were caused by being struck by vehicles, including 14 so far in 05-06. The low proportion of 3-day and major injuries relative to fatalities continues to indicate the significant under-reporting prevalent in agriculture.

[Chairs Note - nb. The 05-06 figures are provisional and only up to Feb 06 and have not been verified by HSE Statistics Branch. This information should not therefore be released publicly until the launch of the HSE Report, expected end of July.]

ACTION - Tony's ppt presentation to be sent to delegates. [Sent with notes of meeting, but please note caveat above.]

5.2 **VOSA Spot Checks** - 30% of tractors stopped by VOSA and 60% of trailers examined were prohibited until their defects were remedied. The latter were mainly due to ineffective brakes. Tony reported that 'Classic Tractor' had run a good article on this campaign. Jake recommended this information should be more widely publicised and the alarming state of equipment found in use on busy roads merited editorial comment in the major farming weeklies and journals.

Delegates discussed how their organisations could make more use of this information to maximise its impact. [nb. Further background information is available in Tony's ppt presentation, issued with these notes. Andy Scarlett suggested information should also be obtained (from/by VOSA) on over-loading.

ACTION - Tony to obtain any weighbridge data from VOSA and circ to members.

All Members to use and publicise the VOSA information. [nb. The accident stats are provisional and have not been verified.]

Cost of Accidents

5.3 At the first meeting NFU Mutual had reported that major injuries caused by road accidents were the most expensive to insurers, constituting ~15% of total claims and totalling ~£53mill paid out by their company in 2003. About half of the 'large loss' accounts (ie claims in excess of £0.5mill) are due to right-turn accidents. David had since analysed and summarised some typical examples of accidents subject to insurance claims. These mostly included accidents on the road, eg due to collisions with farm vehicles or avoiding tractors and equipment turning right, due to mud left on the road, etc, but also some agricultural operations, eg involving an ATV.

5.4 One notable case involved a 16-year-old boy who slipped while trying to climb onto a tractor that was being driven by a farmer's 14-year-old son. He was caught in the power harrow being pulled by the tractor, and his leg had to be amputated at the knee. The farmer was prosecuted by HSE and was fined £5000 with £1200 costs. This would be an ideal case study as it follows through from the investigation to prosecution as well as insurance costs.

ACTION – David Leavesley to confirm disclosability and copy summary of cases to members.

5.4 There was some debate over the % of accidents vs age reported in the previous minutes. NFU Mutual had reported that 46% of drivers involved in collisions were under 30 years old, suggesting a relationship with training and competence. Other common factors included mud and

inconspicuity, eg defective lighting and limited visibility from farm/field exits on to roads. Driver awareness and visibility – maintenance of mirrors, trafficators, etc is vital.

5.5 HSE has arranged for Farmers Weekly to produce a series of themed articles spread over the year, rather than a single Safety Supplement. Child safety would be covered prior to the holiday periods. HSE called for further examples of accidents – anonymised summaries with as much information as possible – although HSE has found it particularly effective to use individuals who are willing to be interviewed to give a personal account of the impact and cost of accidents involving themselves, relatives or friends.

***ACTION** – David to provide these summaries for other stakeholders to use in articles and publicity.*

***Action** - All members asked to identify and provide names of individuals willing to be interviewed to give a personal 'victim' statement.*

6. REVIEW OF RESEARCH, STANDARDS AND DIRECTIVES

6.1 HSE's has just imposed a moratorium on research whilst it assesses its budget and criteria for selecting and supporting projects. However, the Group's members emphasised they are interested in meeting HSE's and the industry's operational aspirations and needs, eg on WBV and HAVS. Jake had reported that consultants and universities are now pushing into this area, exploiting the fears of purchasers/users in some sectors (eg construction) and are creating additional regimes and standards eg for testing and measuring vibration emissions from machinery. HSE appear to be supporting this and the AEA had raised objections. It is important to consider the 'Bigger Picture', ie the impact of Europe, OECD and ISO in setting standards, eg in areas such as cab air filtration and braking systems. The UK cannot do anything alone, and in agriculture in particular, because of the international nature of production and the power of the global market. We therefore have to influence European and international standards.

***ACTION** – Chair to send a letter from the Group indicating the support of DfT and DTI is essential in the standards-making process. [Done.]*

6.2 The AEA had campaigned within the Government to prevent the BBSRC closing Silsoe Research Institute (SRI). HSE and DfT had also lobbied the BBSRC to retain SRI. However, this had been unsuccessful. Members agreed that in allowing this, the main UK agricultural machinery research and testing facility to close, we have lost not only the major national engineering resource, but one of international significance. Unfortunately, various Government Departments still need research work done to set standards and support their legislative and regulatory activities, (including HSE).

6.3 The industry has already written to DfT requesting that MIRA be appointed as the UK Testing House because they have acquired the tractor and cab Type Approval testing equipment (and the staff) from BBSRC/SRI to perform this function. DfT had suggested that this role could be handled by VCA, but they do not have the resources or knowledge to provide this important facility for UK industry and regulators.

6.4 Research identified by AEA members and HSE included the need to define specifications for braking systems and methods for measuring their efficiency. Another urgent key area is to establish levels of exposure to whole body vibration, identify good practice and also produce a standard practical method for measuring exposure levels on machinery.

ACTION – Chair - All present agreed that the Chair should write about the need for this research to Dr Gibby too. [Done; work on WBV supported but other proposals held back by HSE’s moratorium on research.]

6.5 **Current and Future Research** - Dr Andy Scarlett reviewed past and current research and future information needs, relating this to the implications of Directives and for key standards work. A number of transport-related projects were highlighted and discussed, including:

- **Whole-body vibration** (WBV) – In view of the new ‘limit values’ and the high levels of exposure in certain operations, particularly caused by shocks inevitable in vehicles moving over rough ground, together with the association with low back pain related to posture, manual handling, climbing into/exiting machines and other factors prevalent in agriculture and forestry, these industries are recognised as a priority for HSE guidance. As such, HSE intends to complete the recent SRI and HSL research, measuring operator exposure from a range of key machines and operations. This will be developed into ‘best practice’ guidance for managers and operators, highlighting key factors such as the influence of surface condition, speed, seat selection/maintenance and adjustment and vehicle design. It is also intended to establish a standard methodology for assessing WBV emissions. This is needed by manufacturers/ importers and regulators.
- **Tractor/trailer braking systems** - Work is urgently needed on design and performance of braking systems for tractors, trailers and other trailed appliances, Manufacturers are now working actively together to resolve design and compatibility problems.
- **Cab air-filtration** - Development of systems and test methods for tractors and self-propelled pesticide sprayers, etc. This will need to be in 2 phases - initially to develop a standard to adequately remove/control exposure to particulates, followed by (the more difficult) pesticides/chemicals. This is to be dealt with at the international standards level, and needs HSE involvement. **ACTION - HSE**

ACTION – Andy Scarlett - ppt presentation summarising the key issues to be circulated to members [Done,10 March.]

6.6 **Tractor/Trailer Weight Limits** - Andy also helpfully gave a personal interpretation of the complex legal requirements on tractor/trailer weights. [**Chairs Note** - The following information/viewpoint is extracted from Andy’s e-mail sent subsequently to the AEA and AIC]:

- In general terms the limit is 24 imperial tons gross train weight (tractor + trailer + load), which equals 24390 kg in today’s money. BUT, this may be reduced if the tractor (or trailer!) has tracks instead of wheels (down to 22360 kg) or if the distance from the rear axle of the towing vehicle to the rearmost axle of the trailer is less than 2.9 metres (down to 20000 kg).
- Similar games are played with the max gross trailer weight (i.e. excluding the towing vehicle), and this is influenced by the trailer design, axle configuration, date of manufacture and braking system employed (overrun or operated from the tractor foot pedal spool valve operation of trailer brakes limits the trailer gross to 14230 kg). For a balanced (i.e. 4-wheel or converted artic trailer, with at least 3 metres between front & rear axles, the max gross is 18000 kg. For an unbalanced agricultural trailer, which covers the majority of modern designs, the limit is 18290 kg **BUT** this includes the weight imposed on the towing vehicle by the trailer drawbar (which could be up to 3500 kg or even more), so that on the trailer wheels should be reduced accordingly.

- These requirements are complicated and most find them difficult to follow. However, essentially, if the Gross Train Weight exceeds 24 tonnes be wary and if the trailer gross exceeds 18 tonnes, distance yourself!
- All this information is provided in a slightly clearer form in the book “Agricultural Vehicles on the Road” by Andrew McMahon (ISBN: 0 9533058 7 2). It is a good book, not too thick & reasonably priced (~£12). It is about to be revised, but further info can be obtained from the author’s website www.agricultural-vehicles.co.uk

6.7 Members agreed that in view of VOSA’s worrying statistics providing real evidence of the poor condition of brakes on trailers being widely used on the road, there is an urgent need to broaden the tractor brake testing method developed and promoted by BAGMA, to encompass agricultural trailers and other trailed equipment. An initial complementary survey is needed to assess the condition and performance of existing braking systems in use, and to determine their ability to comply with future vehicle braking legislation. Secondly, to identify and verify a suitable methodology for the in-service assessment of ag. trailer / trailed appliance braking system performance, to be used as part of a voluntary, dealer-administered scheme. Unfortunately, further consideration of projects has been suspended pending the review of future funding of R&D.
ACTION - HSE to consider a further project designed to complement BAGMA’s Tractor & Trailer Condition survey.

6.8 A final year student studying Agricultural Business Management at Reading University recently approached HSE for information and contacts for research on his dissertation project, investigating road accidents involving agricultural vehicles. He intends to identify ways in which such accidents can be reduced and is looking into the effects of vehicle condition, driver experience and other road users knowledge of agricultural vehicles. He also intends to investigate the viability of introducing MOT tests for agricultural vehicles. This was related to the research/survey of road accidents involving agricultural machines, being carried out by Richard Gard for DfT.

[Chairs Note – HSE has supplied information and contacts, including DfT, BAGMA and Richard Gard.]

7 ‘DELIVERABLES’

7.1 Alan explained that the priorities for the Group, its potential outputs and outcomes, timescales, resource needs and communications strategy needed to be outlined and summarised in the Project Plan. It was agreed that the main value of the Group was in exchanging information, raising awareness of members of organisations involved and helping HSE to establish its priorities.

ACTION – A Plom [Chairs Note - Revised Project Plan presented to and accepted by AIAC and placed on HSE’s AIAC website.]

7.1 The structure of the list of ideas and actions arising from the ‘Brainstorm Session’ at the first Workshop were agreed to be a sound basis for a list of ‘deliverables’.

ACTION – A Plom to expand to incorporate issues raised at 2nd Workshop and summarise the actions allocated to members individually or collectively. Completed, as follows:-

Communications

General Information (incl accident statistics, cost of accidents, etc)

- Transport related issues should be covered in guidance relating to new legislation e.g. noise, work at height, etc, as far as possible/relevant. **ACTION – HSE, etc**
- **Information** will be exchanged between stakeholders as this is vital to identify and promote the key messages through guidance and publicity, eg articles in journals and newsletters, HSE's e-Bulletin, etc. **ACTION – All Members**
- **Incentives and higher penalties** to be encouraged - Insurers recognising training and certificates of competence and reflecting this in premiums would also provide an incentive. [*Chairs Note - HSE and Lantra SSC are working with Insurers on this with the intention of organising a joint seminar for the Finance and Insurance industry in late 2006-07.*]

ACTION – HSE to organise Seminar and discuss with Lantra.

ACTION - NFU Mutual support this approach and are prepared to present their information on cost of accident claims at the seminar. David Leavesley to clear disclosure of information presented at Workshop and make a summary available to all members.

Safe Vehicles

- **Improving Maintenance** - The most basic requirement of ensuring brakes actually work needs to be promoted effectively. **ACTION – All Members.**
- **Tractor MoT's** - The industry prefers to promote and use the voluntary BAGMA Health Check Scheme and there would be practical and legal difficulties introducing a compulsory 'MoT', as there is no (political) pressure to impose new legislation on this. **ACTION – All to promote the VHCS and maintain a watching brief.**
- **Advice to operators** – NFU's suggestion to develop a decal as an aide memoire and reminder for operators to perform daily checks should be explored. [Nb. However, this is subject to Directives and International Standards. Siting is important - alongside or on the door in the footwell would be preferable, being at eye level as the driver enters the cab and not obstructing vision. Other suggestions included incorporating this info in the tax disc holder and key fobs.

ACTIONS – AEA (and others) to inform/advise members. Sponsorship for key fob to be explored.

- **Pre-start checks** – Automatic built-in pre-start checks could be effective, similar to those used on HGV's.
ACTION – AEA and HSE to discuss, through Standards committees?
- **Improving Vehicle Lighting** - Intensity and position of lights (eg on many tractors and trailers) should be improved.
ACTION – AEA/HSE. However, Type Approval to international standards and the fact that most tractors are now manufactured outside UK likely to prevent improvements being introduced in the medium term.
- **Improving Visibility of vehicles** – In lieu of improving lighting standards, brighter 'safety' colours could be effective in alerting bystanders and other road users to approaching tractors, projections etc.
ACTION – AEA/HSE, although it was accepted that this is again prevented by standardisation procedures and corporate colours schemes for marketing and brand identification.

- **Improving Braking systems** - Current specifications for braking systems on agricultural tractors in international standards are grossly inadequate for the weights being carried (on the road). Research is needed to review and inform the requirements in new draft European legislation and standards.
ACTION – DfT, HSE, AEA
- **Brake testing** - A simple, easily repeatable test protocol is needed, including for tractor/trailer combinations.
ACTION – HSE to attempt to progress the proposal for braking research at ‘Silsoe’ urgently, in consultation/jointly with DfTr. However, there is currently a moratorium on research in HSE.
- **Regulatory Guidance** – The expansion of Type Approval to a wider range of vehicles, including self-propelled and trailed appliances would be significant and needs publicity. There was further debate over published advice and interpretation of the Construction and Use Regs and application of licensing requirements to farm vehicles, eg the NFU’s Transport Guide compared with the AEA’s ‘flowchart’.
- **Trailer weights** – In particular, to overcome the current confusion over maximum vehicle/gross train weights, a simple summary of the (complex) legal requirements should be produced and made widely available, including to feed mills/grain storage plants, etc.
ACTION – DfT & HSE, + AEA, AIC, et al to inform members. [See Dr Scarlett’s summary at para 6.5 above.]
- **Safe design of vehicles** - eg improved visibility, provision of driver aids, reduction in operator exposure to noise and vibration, etc. Raise awareness of the new Regulations and promote the outcome of the recent Silsoe research on WBV.
ACTION – All Members
- **Inspection/enforcement activity** – Members called for a higher enforcement profile by HSE to reinforce guidance and standards, especially targeting the non-compliant. It was also felt HSE should do more to promote designers/manufacturers/importers awareness of their duties under s6 HSWA and European Directives/SMSR.
ACTION – HSE (and other Regulators, VOSA, etc)

Safe Driver

- **Road Safety/driver training issues** – Many (non-farming) companies place greater emphasis on driver training schemes, such as RoSPA’s. This is becoming more important with the increase in tractor speeds and train weights. Some ‘chipped’ tractors are now capable of road-speeds up to 60mph! [AEA/manufacturers emphasise this invalidates warranties and compliance with PUWER.
- **Public awareness** - Should be raised, to anticipate slow moving farm vehicles and potential movements. It is often difficult to distinguish between HGVs and tractor-drawn trailers.
- **ATV Safety** – This is a major concern, given the steady occurrence of accidents, including deaths, also involving children and young persons. Promotion of training is vital together with wearing if helmets.
ACTION – All Members.
[Examples include the AEA’s promotion of the EASI Training Scheme and their continuing campaign to highlight these issues in the media and at shows, etc; a possible joint initiative between NFU / NFU Mutual to promote provision and wearing helmets and run a ‘SAD’ day for ATV users - possibly in conjunction with a supplier?]

- **Worker safety** – Article(s) covering issues raised to be published in TGWU's Landworker. *ACTION – Ian Beeby.*
- **Motorcycle accidents** - He is also an Advanced Motorcycle instructor and offered to place an article in 'Bike' magazine on the prevalence of motorcycle accidents involving farm vehicles on the road. *ACTION – Ian Beeby.*

Safe sites

- **Site Management** – In addition to the usual precautions of site rules, segregation of pedestrians from vehicles, provision of walkways, warnings, mirrors etc, HSE is this year focussing on the interaction between transport issues and the Working at Height and Slips and Trips Programmes, eg delivery vehicles/drivers using unsuitable or unsafe access equipment available on site. This needs to be highlighted and publicised in guidance. *ACTION – All Members*
- **Road Safety - Turning** – Insurers highlight turning right as the main cause of injury/losses. Providing turning points and slip lanes at approaches to known right turn blackspots was one solution, to be promoted in guidance and articles. Drivers should be encouraged to use verges etc as 'havens' and to display effective warning signs. *ACTION – All Members, NFU Mutual and other insurers to share any research findings.*
- **Work activities on the Road** - Linked to the above is roadside working and debris on the road (e.g. mud, hedge cuttings, etc).

8. EVALUATION

8.1 Alan Plom emphasised that the Group needs to identify methods and measures of 'success' (or otherwise!). Tools and mechanisms currently available include:

- **Baseline data** – BAGMA's research project involving their dealers to collect baseline data on the condition of farm vehicles in use would help to compensate for the reduction in information being collected due to the reduction in on-farm inspections by HSE. This will enable evaluation and targeting of interventions. *ACTION – BAGMA + HSE/DfTr: BAGMA to prepare summary of data on completion of project in October 2006, for consideration by HSE (and DfTr).*
- **Level of compliance** – of vehicles and operators (although these will be difficult to measure without sound base-lines).
- **Hits on websites, trends in requests for guidance, publications, etc**
ACTION – All Members to assess.
- **Level of Training** – for example, proportion of dealer staff trained by BAGMA, and number of operators receiving training on 'installation' (supply). Lantra SSC are carrying out research on the quality of training and assessing 'transfer of knowledge' within the industry.
- **Adoption/understanding of training** – eg based on use of proposed 'Best Practice' guidance on WBV and impact of training on operators. *[Proposal by Scarlett Research Ltd.]*
- **Bomel's 'Barometer of Culture Change'** tool - being developed and tested for use by HSE staff to measure 'influence' of HSE's interventions.

ACTION – Members invited to submit any other ideas/methods of evaluating the impact of the Group.

9. REVIEW/FEEDBACK

9.1 The revised terms of reference, aims and objectives of the Group outlined in the previously circulated revised version of the draft workplan (v4) were broadly accepted, but would need updating for presentation to AIAC.

ACTION – A Plom/All Members [Completed and to be placed on website when agreed by members.]

9.2 The various action points were reviewed, confirming commitments given and the issues for Alan Plom to report to AIAC on 21/3/06. *[Done]*

10. FUTURE OF THE GROUP - DATE OF NEXT MEETING

10.1 It was agreed that to be worthwhile, it is important for all to remain engaged and positive, to actively share information and to coordinate and work together, eg in joint publicity campaigns, to maintain the impetus and avoid becoming disillusioned.

10.2 Topics requested for future discussion include feedback on the BAGMA research and other relevant work, such as the WBV research and development of braking standards. Members also wish to hear how HSE's projects, communications and resources progress during the summer and are keen to assist with the planning process for new work in 2007-08. Logical timing agreed for the next meeting was therefore late autumn 2006.

ACTION – A Plom to organise 3rd Workshop in October/November? Date/location TBA asap.

ALAN PLOM

Head of Safety Section

Agriculture and Food Sector

HSE, Stoneleigh Park, Kenilworth, Warks CV8 2LG

Tel: 024 7669 8356, Fax: 024 7669 6542

e-mail: alan.plom@hse.gsi.gov.uk